

**PREDICTIVE MODELS OF BUSINESS
FAILURE FOR CORPORATE ENTERPRISES:
A STUDY IN INDIAN CONTEXT**

SEYED MOHAMMADALI NABIZADEH



**DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT STUDIES
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI**

JANUARY 2015

Predictive Models of Business Failure for Corporate Enterprises: A Study in Indian Context

By

Syed Mohammadali Nabizadeh

Department of Management Studies

Submitted
in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy



Indian Institute of Technology Delhi

January 2015

CERTIFICATE

The thesis titled, “Predictive Models of Business Failure for Corporate Enterprises: A Study in Indian Context”, being submitted by Mr. Seyed Mohammadali Nabizadeh to Indian Institute of Technology, Delhi for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D) is a record bonafide research work carried out by him. He has worked under our guidance and supervision, and has fulfilled all the requirements for the submission of this thesis, which has attained the standard required for a Ph. D degree of this institute. The results presented in this thesis have not been submitted elsewhere for the award of any degree or diploma.

(Prof. P.K. Jain)

Professor

Department of Management Studies

Indian Institute of Technology

New Delhi

(Prof. M. P. Gupta)

Professor

Department of Management Studies

Indian Institute of Technology

New Delhi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I express my deepest gratitude to my guides Prof. P. K. Jain and Prof. M. P. Gupta for their benevolent guidance, continuous support, clear vision, encouragement and untiring zeal of mind. They inspired me to work hard and gave their valuable time whenever I needed. Without their motivation and continuous support, the study could not be possible. Their simplicity, humbleness, soft spoken advice, belongingness, sense of duty and broad vision are exceptionally admirable. I will remember throughout my life their tremendous patience and untiring effort to develop a researcher out of me.

I acknowledge Prof. K. T. Bhal (Head, Department of Management Studies) for her encouragement, help and support. I sincerely thank Prof. Sushil (Chairman, Student Research Committee) for inculcating useful insights, prominent advice, humble attitude and discussions at various times in the improvement of this research effort. I express my heartfelt thanks for the precious advice and prudent suggestions received from the members of Student Research Committee Prof. S. S. Yadav and Dr. N. Bolia (Department of Mechanical Engineering). I am extremely thankful to all faculty members of the Department of Management Studies for their encouragement and help.

I express my heartiest gratitude to my wife, Hale Mofidi for her continuous encouragement, understanding and resilience to conduct the work, being patient and staying with me far from her family. I take this opportunity to thank my lovely parents for their unconditional supports, financial and emotional helps and never ending

motivation which kept me going. I would particularly like to acknowledge the sacrifices that my family has made for the sake of my professional growth.

I wish to thank all research scholars of DMS, IIT Delhi for their support during my research work. I am grateful to all non-teaching staff members for cooperating and being on my side. Finally, I wish to thank to all persons who have directly and indirectly helped me in this research work.

Seyed Mohammadali Nabizadeh

Date:

ABSTRACT

This thesis presents a study of various factors that are responsible for failure of corporates in India. In doing so, it brings out few models built around these factors that have predictive abilities of failure of Indian corporate enterprises. This study is necessitated by the fact that, though literature cites many predictive models, performance and reliability of these models are dependent on the business environment of the country under study. A well performing predictive model in a country may not lead to accurate prediction in another country. Since there is no prior study reported covering Indian corporate settings, it raises an opportunity to identify factors of failure, and work out suitable models based on these that have capability to predict business failure of Indian corporates. These are helpful in generating advance warning signals and initiate suitable remedial actions.

The research has been designed to follow three main objectives: to identify financial ratios whose ability to predict business failure is sharp; to develop predictive models (based on the identified financial ratios) useful in forewarning business failure; and to test the validity of predictive models.

For data collection, financial statements of all listed companies at the National Stock Exchange (NSE) of India for the financial years of 2008-9, 2009-10 and 2010-11, were considered. From the record, 91 companies were found as failed firms. Using a match pair sampling, the analysis has been carried out by a sample of total 182 NSE companies that includes 91 failed and 91 non-failed firms.

Three different methods were used: one-way ANOVA, Wilks' Lambda method and Likelihood Ratio method.

The analysis was conducted in two phases over two sets of data i.e. one relates to ten years (2001-2 to 2010-11) time span and another for five years (2006-7 to 2010-11) period. It resulted five sets of predictive variables for business failure prediction; two (2) of which are related to ten years period and other three (3) are to five years period.

It is interesting to note that few ratios are common to all sets of predictive factor. These included Sales/Total Assets, Acid-test Ratio, Cash to Current Liabilities, Raw Material Turnover and Finished Goods Turnover. These form a strong basis to further develop suitable models of failure prediction. To do so, three methods were chosen for further analysis, namely; Multiple Discriminant analysis (MDA) and Logistic regression (Logit) and neural network (NN). Reason for deploying these methods is that these have been observed to be the most efficient predictive models, hence remain dominant choice by the researchers of bankruptcy.

To this end, use of five sets of ratios over three methods led us to develop 15 unique models of business failure prediction, a significant contribution of this research.

These models were further validated over a new sample of 30 failed and 30 non-failed companies, for a period of ten years time span (2003-4 to 2012-13). The validation results are found satisfactory as they indicate all five models are able to predict business failure with an accuracy of almost 75% (highest being 78.3% of accuracy). Accuracy is further higher with data of five years time span. To augment this research, analysis with Neural network is also carried out for predicting business failures. Models developed by neural networks method are more accurate than other presented models.

CONTENTS

<i>Certificate</i>	i
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	iii
<i>Abstract</i>	v
<i>Contents</i>	vii
<i>List of Figure</i>	xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>List of Annexures</i>	xvii
Chapter 1: Introduction of the Study	1
Background	1
Motivation of the Research	3
Outline of the Study	4
Scope of the Study is Limited to Cover	5
Methodology of the Study	5
Organization of the Thesis	6
Concluding Observations	6
Chapter 2: Literature Review	7
Introduction	7
Section 1: Definitions of Business Failure in Literature	8
<i>Theoretical Definition of Business Failure</i>	8
<i>Operational Definition of Business Failure</i>	9
Section 2: Legal Perspective of Business Failure in India	11
Section 3: Business Failure Prediction and Financial Ratios	14
Section 4: Review of Predictive Methods for Business Failure	20
<i>Review of Studies based on Statistical Methods</i>	21
<i>Review of Studies based on Intelligent Techniques</i>	34
Research Gaps	46

Chapter 3: Research Design	47
Introduction	47
Section 1: Research Enquiry	47
<i>Research Questions</i>	47
<i>Research Objectives</i>	48
Section 2: Research Variables and Scope of the Study	49
<i>Dependent Variable</i>	49
<i>Independent Variables</i>	50
<i>Scope of the Research</i>	53
Section 3: Methodology of Research	55
<i>Towards Predictive Models</i>	56
<i>Validation</i>	58
Section 4: Data Collection and Sample	59
Concluding Observations	62
Annexure	64
Chapter 4: Identification of Business Failure Predictive Factors	67
Introduction	67
Section 1: Data Source	67
Section 2: Identification of Financial Ratios by Use of ANOVA	70
Section 3: Identification of Financial Ratios by Use of Wilks' Lambda Method	72
Section 4: Identification of Financial Ratios by Use of Likelihood Ratio Method	75
Section 5: Summary of Major Findings	79
Concluding Observations	82
Annexures	83
Chapter 5: Creation of Business Failure Predictive Models	103
Introduction	103
Section 1: Model based on Multiple Discriminant Analysis (MDA)	103
For the period of 10 years (2001-2 to 2010-11)	105
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Wilks' Lambda method</i>	105
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Likelihood ratios</i>	106
For the period of 5 years (2006-7 to 2010-11)	108
<i>By the use of factors recognized by ANOVA method</i>	108

<i>By the use of factors recognized by Wilks' Lambda method</i>	109
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Likelihood Ratio</i>	111
<i>Summary of Model Creation by use of MDA</i>	113
Section 2: Model Creation by Use of Logistic Regression	113
For the period of 10 years (2001-2 to 2010-11)	114
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Wilks' Lambda method</i>	114
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Likelihood Ratios</i>	115
For the period of 5 years (2006-7 to 2010-11)	117
<i>By the use of factors recognized by ANOVA method</i>	117
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Wilks' Lambda method</i>	118
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Likelihood Ratio</i>	120
<i>Summary of Model Creation by Use of Logistic Regression</i>	122
Section 3: Model Creation by Use of Neural Networks	122
For the period of 10 years (2001-2 to 2010-11)	123
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Wilks' Lambda method</i>	123
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Likelihood Ratios</i>	126
For the period of 5 years (2006-7 to 2010-11)	129
<i>By the use of factors recognized by ANOVA method</i>	129
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Wilks' Lambda method</i>	131
<i>By the use of factors recognized by Likelihood Ratio</i>	133
<i>Summary of Model Creation by Use of Neural Networks</i>	135
Concluding Observations	135
Annexures	136
Chapter 6: Validation of Business Failure Predictive Models	177
Introduction	177
Section 1: The Approach	177
Section 2: Validation of Multiple Discriminant Analysis (MDA) Models	178
Section 3: Validation of Logistic Regression Models	182
Section 4: Validation of Neural Networks Models	185
Section 5: Summary of Results	189
Concluding Observations	191
Annexure	192

Chapter 7: Summary and Conclusions	195
Introduction	195
Summary of Research	195
<i>Key Financial Ratios</i>	197
<i>Predictive Models</i>	199
<i>Model Validation</i>	200
Implication of the Study	201
<i>Implication for Practice</i>	201
<i>Implication for Research</i>	202
Major Research Contributions	202
Revisiting of the Research Questions and Objectives	203
Limitations of the Research	204
Scope of Future Research	205
<i>Bibliography</i>	207