

**OPTIMISATION OF NUTRIENT RECOVERY PROCESS  
FROM HUMAN URINE - AN ECOSAN APPROACH**

**MD. AZIZUR RAHMAN**



**CENTRE FOR RURAL DEVELOPMENT & TECHNOLOGY  
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI  
JULY 2016**

©Indian Institute of Technology Delhi (IITD), New Delhi, 2016

**OPTIMISATION OF NUTRIENT RECOVERY PROCESS  
FROM HUMAN URINE - AN ECOSAN APPROACH**

by

**MD. AZIZUR RAHMAN**

**CENTRE FOR RURAL DEVELOPMENT & TECHNOLOGY**

**Submitted**

**in fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor Of Philosophy**

**to the**



**INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI  
JULY 2016**

## CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that “**Optimisation of Nutrient recovery Process from Human Urine- An Ecosan Approach**” being submitted by **Md Azizur Rahman** to the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi for the award of **Doctor of Philosophy** is a record of original bonafide research work carried out by him under my guidance and supervision. In my opinion, the thesis has reached the standard of fulfilling the requirements of all the regulations related to the degree. The research report and results presented in this thesis have not been submitted, in part or in full, to any other university or institution for the award of any degree or diploma. I certify that he has pursued the prescribed course of research.

Date:  
New Delhi

Dr Vijayaraghavan M Chariar  
Associate Professor  
Centre for Rural Development and Technology  
Indian Institute of Technology Delhi  
New Delhi- 110016, India

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

*I wish to express my heartiest gratitude and sincere regards to my respected supervisor, Dr Vijayaraghavan M Chariar for his constant inspiration, encouragement, invaluable guidance and help that he bestowed on me right from the inception to the successful completion of this endeavor.*

*I am very grateful to my SRC members, Prof Arunachalam Ramanan, Prof Kamal K Pant, and Dr Anushree Malik for their constructive criticism and valuable suggestions.*

*I would like to express my sincere thanks to Prof Satyawati Sharma, Head, Centre for Rural Development and Technology, Indian Institute of Technology Delhi, for her kind support in sanctioning funds required for my research and for access to facilities in the centre and institute.*

*I would like to express my thanks and gratitude to all my friends and colleagues for their direct and indirect help. I am especially thankful to Dr S Ramesh Sakthivel for the many discussions in the formative stages of this work and the small suggestions throughout the course of this research. His vast experience in the field of sanitation has helped me in enriching my research. I am immensely grateful to Ms Nalini Srinivasan, Research Scholar, CRDT, IIT Delhi for her constant support and encouragement during the difficult phases of my PhD.*

*I extend my grateful thanks to the senior members of our “Design for Sustainability Group” - Dr Chandra Shekhar Verma, Dr Sutapa Pati, and Dr Ganesh Prabhu V for their constant support and motivation during this journey.*

*My heart-felt gratitude to Mr Naresh Kumar Sharma and Ms Mona Chhabra Anand, both senior Research Scholars at CRDT for the invaluable assistance and suggestions they provided for my research work.*

*I would also like to acknowledge the support received from Mr Satyendra Singh, Research Scholar, Department of Biochemical Engineering and Biotechnology, IIT Delhi, Ms Uzma Anjum, Research Scholar, Department of Chemical Engineering, IIT Delhi, Mr Ejaz Ahmad, M.Tech Student, Department of Chemical Engineering, IIT Delhi, Mr Somnath Sarkar and Mr Gaurav Sharma, Research Scholars, Department of NMR, All India Institute of Medical Sciences, Delhi for support in completing experimentation, discussions regarding analysis and for motivating me in my quest for clarity.*

*I offer my sincere gratitude to Mr Arun Shanker, Project Associate of our Research Group at CRDT, IIT Delhi for his immense support in preparing the illustrations and in formatting my thesis and research papers. I sincerely acknowledge the logistics support of Rohan Kumar, Project Attendant which was invaluable in completion stages of my research.*

*I would also like to acknowledge Ms Kausalya Chariar for constant motivation, support and guidance during the period and continuously having belief in me for my success.*

*I gratefully acknowledge the unconditional support and cooperation of my parents and brother Md Hafizur Rahman throughout my entire study years.*

*Finally, thanks to 'ALMIGHTY ALLAH' for HIS impeccable guidance and support, which helped me to remain focused in entire period of my journey and I humbly seek His continued benevolence and blessings.*

*Md Azizur Rahman*

## **ABSTRACT**

The liquid fraction of anthropogenic human waste - human urine - has for some time now been recognized as a potential nutrient source. Various methods have been developed for recovering and reusing nutrients present in human urine. Processes such as direct urine application to recovering nutrients in the form of struvite have been reported and practiced around the world. The concept of using urine in agriculture or for recovering nutrients India is still to gain wide acceptability. Except for a few research reports on direct application of urine in agriculture and some studies on a continuous flow reactor for struvite precipitation from urine, there are limited reports on end users' perception, acceptability of urine in liquid form or in salt precipitate etc.

Any idea for implementation of technology which is to be adopted by the society, it is important to analyze and take into consideration the societal, the technological and the scientific aspects of the technology. At present there is no guideline to help local governments, be they are rural or urban - to choose which nutrient recovery technology is most suitable for a particular context. Recovery of nutrients from human urine is an important aspect of environmental sanitation systems which will result in better health of water bodies as well as reduced energy consumption on wastewater treatment. This thesis aims in the connecting the dots between societal, technological and scientific approach in developing and addressing the nutrient recovery process from human urine. A survey conducted among farmers countywide throws some light on which options

may be preferred by the potential end users of human urine or nutrients recovered from human urine. The study on comparison and evaluation of various nutrient recovery technologies based on a net-scoring method carried out by researchers recommends options for various scenarios helps in looking on to the options for nutrient recovery process as an business option. This research concludes that choice of nutrient recovery technology is governed by economic factors such as fixed cost, operational cost and value of the end product and by technological fit with the setting. Following the evaluation of different processes of nutrient recovery, a process for maximal nutrient recovery (namely N, P and K) from human urine has been explored. It was concluded that desorption of ammonia from hydrolyzed urine followed by struvite precipitation can offer an encouraging option for nutrient recovery. This research opens up some new possibilities - social, scientific and technological - in visualizing urine not as waste but as a potential resource.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Certificate</i>	I
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	II
<i>Abstract</i>	IV
<i>List of Contents</i>	VI
<i>List of Figures</i>	VIII
<i>List of Tables</i>	X
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	XI
<b>Chapter 1 : INTRODUCTION</b>	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Waste as Source of Nutrients	5
1.3 Characteristics of Human Urine	7
1.3.1 Human Urine	7
<b>Chapter 2 : LITERATURE REVIEW ON NUTRIENT RECOVERY &amp; RECYCLING</b>	11
2.1 Urine in Agriculture and Aquaculture	11
2.2 P-Recovery	17
2.2.1 Precipitation using Bittern	20
2.2.2 Recovery and Reuse of Phosphorus in India	21
2.2.2.1 Case Study 1: Karnataka	21
2.2.2.2 Case Study 2: IIT Delhi and TamilNadu	23

2.3	N-Recovery	25
	2.3.1 Gas Liquid Stripping (Ammonia Stripping)	25
	2.3.2 Zeolite Adsorption	27
	2.3.3 Isobutylaldehyde-diurea (IBDU) Precipitation	28
2.4	Accumulation of N P K	28
	2.4.1 Duckweed Pond Culture	28
	2.4.2 Aquaponics	30
2.5	K-Recovery	30
2.6	Reviews on survey methods used related to Urine in Agriculture	32
2.7	Summary	34
	<b>Chapter 3 : GAP, RESEARCH OBJECTIVES &amp; RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</b>	36
3.1	Research Gap	36
3.2	Research Objectives	37
3.3	Research Methodology	38
	<b>Chapter 4 : ACCEPTANCE BY INDIAN FARMERS OF HUMAN URINE AS A SOIL CONDITIONER AND WATER SOURCE</b>	40
4.1	Introduction	40
	4.1.1 The Agricultural Context	43
4.2	Objectives	53
4.3	Methodology	53

4.3.1	Research Approach	53
4.3.2	Research Method	54
4.4	Result and Analysis	57
4.5	Discussion	64
4.6	Conclusions	68
<b>Chapter 5 : TECHNO-ECONOMIC ASSESSMENT OF NUTRIENT RECOVERY PROCESS FOR HUMAN URINE</b>		<b>70</b>
5.1	Introduction	70
5.2	Methodology	71
5.3	Results and Discussion	75
5.4	Conclusions	81
<b>Chapter 6 : PROCESS DEVELOPMENT FOR RECOVERY OF N, P, K FROM HUMAN URINE</b>		<b>83</b>
6.1	Introduction	83
6.1.1	NuRuBas Process	84
6.1.2	STUN Reactor (Model 1)	84
6.1.3	Yellow Water Treatment Plant	85
6.1.4	Principle of stripping and absorption	87
6.1.5	Mass Transfer in batch stripping unit	89
6.2	Materials and methods	90

6.2.1	Experimental setup and testing	90
6.2.2	Chemical Analysis	93
6.2.3	Physical Analysis	93
6.3	Results and Discussion	94
6.3.1	Ammonia Removal	94
6.3.2	Experimental mass transfer coefficient of ammonia	99
6.3.3	Phosphate recovery	102
6.3.4	Potassium Recovery	103
6.3.5	Physical Analysis of precipitates	104
6.3.5.1	Physical Structure and Characteristics	105
6.4	Conclusion	111
	<b>Chapter 7 : CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE SCOPE</b>	112
7.1	Conclusions of the Research	115
7.2	Relevance of the Research	115
7.3	Some limitations of the study	117
7.4	Recommendations and Implications of this Research	117
7.5	Scope of future work	119
	REFERENCE	120
	ANNEXURES	133
	ANNEXURE I: Acceptance by Indian farmers of Human Urine as a Soil Conditioner and water Source	134

ANNEXURE II: Techno-Economic Survey Form on nutrient recovery process	136
ANNEXURE III: Test results of EDX for precipitate samples	137
ANNEXURE IV: FTIR responses for the precipitate samples	147
ANNEXURE V: X-Ray diffraction peak data of the precipitate samples	152
List of Publications from this Research	169
Brief Biodata of Author	170

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure No.	Description	Page No.
2.1	Different stages of the study a)Collection of urine using Ecosan b) Storing of the collected urine c) Application of urine to the fields d) Sowing of Maize seeds e) Control Maize f) Urine applied Maize	22
2.2	(a) Schematic of the pilot scale reactor; (b) The reactor set-up with urine and bittern storage tanks used in the experiments	24
2.3	Sloping channel (a) and over head stirrer (b) used for mixing urine and bittern (c) Struvite precipitated from stored urine in the experiments	24
2.4	X-ray diffractogram of the (a) Precipitate obtained in the experiment and (b) Struvite standard	25
4.1	Map of Argo-Climatics Zones in India	45
4.2	Main steps for Research Process	54
4.3	Flowchart representation of the methodology followed in the survey	55
4.4	Representative data analysis for Southern region	57
4.5	Representative data analysis for Eastern region	58
4.6	Representative data analysis for North Eastern region	60
4.7	Representative data analysis for Western region	61
4.8	Representative data analysis for Central region	62
4.9	Representative data analysis for Northern region	63

4.10	Representative data for awareness in different regions in India	65
4.11	Representative data for administering of human urine in different regions in India	66
4.12	Representative data for reasons for not using human urine in different regions in India	67
4.13	Representative data for use in future of human urine in different regions in India	68
5.1	Schematic summary diagram of the different nutrient recovery/ reuse process from human urine	73
5.2	Radial graph representation of the various technology options for nutrient recovery / reuse from human urine considered for techno-economic assessment	78
5.3	Radial graph representation of the Technology and Economic prospective of various technology options for nutrient recovery / reuse from human urine considered for techno-economic assessment	79
5.4	Net score evaluation of different nutrient recovery processes	79
6.1	The NuRuBas Process	84
6.2	STUN reactor (Etter et al. 2011)	85
6.3	The Yellow Water Treatment Plant process	86
6.4	The Two- Film Theory for gas transfer	88
6.5	Pictorial representation of the ammonia desorption setup	91
6.6	Ammonia removal efficiency with different aeration rate (a) pH 10 and temperature 40 <sup>0</sup> C; (b) pH 10 and temperature 50 <sup>0</sup> C	97
6.7	Ammonia removal efficiency with different aeration rate (a) pH 12 and temperature 40 <sup>0</sup> C; (b) pH 12 and temperature	98

6.8	(a) Natural logarithm of ammonia nitrogen concentration (constant air flow, constant temperature)	101
	(b) Natural logarithm of ammonia nitrogen concentration (constant air flow, constant pH)	102
	(c) Natural logarithm of ammonia nitrogen concentration (constant pH and constant temperature)	92
6.9	EDX graphs for different precipitate samples	106-108
6.12	SEM images and XRD data for different precipitate samples	108-110

## LIST OF TABLES

Table No.	Description	Page No.
1.1	Typical composition of household waste water (adopted from Morel, 2002; Langergraber and Muellegger, 2005)	06
1.2	Some components of nutrient value in human urine (based on Altman and Dittmer: Biological Handbook, 1974)	07
1.3	Some components of nutrient value in human urine (based on Altman and Dittmer: Biological Handbook, 1974)	08
1.4	Concentrations of some metals in urine and faeces compared with farmyard manure on organic cattle farms in Sweden (from Jönsson <i>et al.</i> , 2004)	09
2.1	Composition of artificial urine solution in deionised water (Udert, 2003)	20
4.1	Representative data for annual rainfall, percentage irrigated land and crop cultivation in the six agro-climatic zones	56
5.1	Main components of the nutrient recovery/reuse technologies & key inputs	71
5.2	Techno-economic factors for technology evaluation	74
5.3	Response score of various Techno-Economic factors	74
5.4	Total net scores of different technologies with respect to response scores	75
6.1	Composition of artificial urine considered in the experiment (Based on Griffith <i>et al.</i> , 1976)	92
6.2	Test Condition for Ammonia desorption	93
6.3	Ammonia recovery efficiency for pH 10	96

6.4	Ammonia recovery efficiency for pH 12	96
6.5	( $K_L \cdot a$ ) values for ammonia removal from urine at different experimental conditions	102
6.6	Selected Cation and Anion concentration in the effluent samples	103
6.7	EDX analysis data for selected precipitate samples	104

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

%	Percent
μm	Micrometer
°C	Degree Celcius
ANNAMOX	ANAerobic AMMONium Oxidation
APHA	American Public Health Association
CFU	Colony Forming Unit
CPCB	Central Pollution Control Board
CSTR	Continuous Stirred Tank Reactor
EU	European Union
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
Fig.	Figure
g	Gram
g/h	Gram per Hour
g/l	Gram per Liter
g/m <sup>2</sup>	Gram per Meter square
g/m <sup>3</sup>	Gram per cubic meter
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH (German Federal Enterprise for International Cooperation)
GNP	Gross National Product
Hrs	Hours
Kg/Ha	Kilogram per Hectare
L/min.	Liter per minute
M	Molar/Meter
m <sup>2</sup> /m <sup>3</sup>	Meter square per meter cube
m <sup>3</sup>	Cubic Meter
m <sup>3</sup> /h	Cubic meter per Hour
mgL <sup>-1</sup>	Milligram per Liter
MLD	Million liters per day
mlL <sup>-1</sup>	Milliliter per Liter
Mm	Millimeter
N	Normal (Strength of Solution)
NH <sub>4</sub> -N/L	Ammonia Nitrogen per Liter
NPK	Nitrogen Phosphorus and Potassium
Ppm	Parts per million
r.p.m	Rotation per minute
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
US EPA	United States Environmental Protection Agency