

**STUDY OF SELECT ISSUES IN THE
MANAGEMENT OF LOW-COST HEALTHCARE
DELIVERY IN INDIA**

SONYMOL K



**DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT STUDIES
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI
NEW DELHI – 110016, INDIA**

MARCH 2023

**STUDY OF SELECT ISSUES IN THE
MANAGEMENT OF LOW-COST HEALTHCARE
DELIVERY IN INDIA**

By

SONYMOL K

Department of Management Studies

Submitted

in fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

to the



INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

NEW DELHI – 110016, INDIA

MARCH 2023

CERTIFICATE

The thesis entitled “**Study of select issues in the management of low-cost healthcare delivery in India**” being submitted by **Ms. Sonymol K** to the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi, for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Ph.D.) is a record of bona fide research work carried out by her. She has worked under my guidance and supervision and has fulfilled the requirements for the submission of this thesis, which has attained the standard required for a Ph.D. degree from the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi. The results presented in this thesis have not been submitted elsewhere for the award of any degree or diploma.

Prof. Ravi Shankar

Supervisor

Department of Management Studies
Indian Institute of Technology Delhi
Hauz Khas, New Delhi-110016
India.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I express heartfelt thanks with a deep sense of gratitude and respect to Prof. Ravi Shankar for his guidance and support. I also thank members of research committee Prof. Vigneswara Ilavarasan, Prof. Surendra S Yadav, Prof. Abhijit Majumdar (Textile Engineering department) for the inspiration, valuable suggestions, and guidance.

I am obliged to all officials and staff of IIT Delhi, especially from research section, and department of management studies. Research scholars and students of IIT Delhi those who have supported wholeheartedly during the journey of PhD.

Next, would like to extend my sincere gratitude towards the reviewers and evaluators of this research work that resulted in roving the quality of research through their necessary suggestions and corrections. I gratefully recognize their support and commitment.

I express gratitude to all individuals and organizations who directly or indirectly facilitated me through survey participation, reviews, Interviews, facility observations, and process observations etc.

Sonymol K

ABSTRACT

The idea of providing healthcare is evolving and poised for a significant advance. The biggest issue in rural India is access to healthcare facilities. The chance to revamp the hospital's infrastructure and care continuum has been provided by Covid. In parallel with medical research, insurance penetration and technological advancement have grown rapidly. Rural communities face significant challenges in getting affordable healthcare, and overall healthcare costs are rising. Delivery of low-cost healthcare is dependent on the availability of health insurance, the population's ability to pay, accessibility, the health insurance's ability to reimburse, and the early detection and knowledge of diseases.

This study uses TISM, ISM, MICMAC, EFA, and PCA to cluster the elements that contribute to the provision of healthcare at a cheap cost. These two goals have helped healthcare administrators identify the components of efficient healthcare delivery. The low-cost healthcare delivery model of an eye organization was investigated using the SAP-LAP methodology, and the organization's procedures and pandemic readiness were also examined. These goals can help healthcare administrators and investors better understand and integrate low-cost healthcare delivery models into their systems. The next goal is to examine one innovative model of the healthcare delivery system, hybrid healthcare. In order to determine whether the healthcare hybrid model was profitable and viable in the healthcare echo system, its revenue, expenses, depreciation cost and capital investment were examined, and concluded that this model is cost-effective. Even though much insurance is not patient-friendly, health insurances are essential for providing low-cost healthcare. Many factors, such as indirect charges (such as transportation and food), discharge prescriptions, and some diagnostic procedures, are not covered by insurance.

Understanding a patient-friendly insurance plan that can give reduced costs across the board is crucial. The ideal insurance plan can be found by applying the results of this research, which were used to examine another aim using the t-Test and ANOVA.

Every objective is supported by the approach and results. Each objective's recommendations are provided. The findings are important for investors and healthcare administrators because healthcare is currently in high demand. Covid offers us the chance to alter healthcare and discover new healthcare business opportunities like telemedicine and home healthcare. In reality, Covid helped us become more creative and tech-savvy. Additionally, it has provided us with a chance to appreciate the benefits of preventive healthcare and the significance of leading healthy lives. These goals' recommendations are crucial for delivering public healthcare at a reasonable cost.

सारांश

उच्च स्तरीय स्वास्थ्य सेवा प्रदान करने का विचार निरंतर विकसित हो रहा है और एक महत्वपूर्ण प्रगति की ओर अग्रसर है। इस दिशा में एक महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दा कम लागत वाली स्वास्थ्य सुविधाओं को सुनिश्चित करने का है।

अस्पतालों में सुधार, बुनियादी ढांचा विकसित करना, और देखभाल की निरंतरता महत्वपूर्ण कारक हैं। चिकित्सा अनुसंधान के समानांतर, बीमा पैठ और तकनीकी प्रगति भी तेजी से बढ़ी है। सस्ती स्वास्थ्य सेवा प्राप्त करने में विभिन्न चुनौतियों का सामना करना पड़ रहा है, और इससे समग्र स्वास्थ्य देखभाल की लागत बढ़ रही है। कम लागत वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवा की डिलीवरी स्वास्थ्य बीमा की उपलब्धता पर भी निर्भर करती है। अधिसंख्य जनसंख्या की भुगतान करने की क्षमता, पहुंच, स्वास्थ्य बीमा की प्रतिपूर्ति करने की क्षमता, और शीघ्र रोगों का पता लगाना और उनका ज्ञान अत्यंत महत्वपूर्ण है।

यह अध्ययन टी.आई.एस.एम., आई.एस.एम., मिकमैक, ई.एफ.ए. और पी.सी.ए. आदि पद्धतियों का उपयोग उन तत्वों को क्लस्टर करने के लिए करता है जो इस उद्देश्य में योगदान करते हैं तथा सस्ती कीमत पर स्वास्थ्य सेवा प्रदान करना सुनिश्चित करते हैं। इन अनुसन्धान में कम लागत वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवा के लिए सैप-लैप पद्धति का उपयोग करके एक स्वास्थ्य संगठन के वितरण मॉडल की जांच की गई है और संगठन की प्रक्रियाओं और महामारी की तैयारी को भी परखा गया है। यह अनुसन्धान कम लागत वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवा को बेहतर ढंग से समझने और लागू करने में मददगार है।

इसमें एक ऐसे मॉडल को विकसित किया गया है जो स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं को कम लागत पर प्रदान करना सुनिश्चित करता है। इसके विभिन्न कारकों जैसे अप्रत्यक्ष शुल्क (जैसे परिवहन और भोजन), स्वास्थ्य बीमा आदि का अल्प लागत की स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं पर प्रभाव का भी अध्ययन इस अनुसंधान में किया गया है। इस शोध के परिणामों को लागू करके आदर्श बीमा योजना के अवयवों का पता लगाया गया है तथा उन्हें टी-टेस्ट और एनोवा जैसी पूर्व स्थापित पद्धतियों द्वारा प्रामाणिक रूप से जांचा गया है। टेलीमेडिसिन और होम हेल्थकेयर जैसे नए स्वास्थ्य सेवा घटकों का भी अध्ययन इसमें सम्मिलित है। इस अध्ययन में उचित कीमत पर सार्वजनिक स्वास्थ्य सेवा प्रदान करने के लिए महत्वपूर्ण सिफारिशें प्रस्तावित हैं।

KEYWORDS AND LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED

Keywords:

ACH	Air Changes Per Hour
ACNO	Assistant Chief Nursing Officer
AHRQ	Agency For Healthcare Research and Quality's
ANOVA	Analysis Of Variance
ASHA	Accredited Social Health Activist
BOP	Bottom of Pyramid
BPI	Buying Power Index
BPL	Below Poverty Line
CAHPS	Consumer Assessment Of Healthcare Providers & Systems
CBHI	Community-Based Health Insurance
CDC	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
CFA	Confirmatory Factor Analysis
CHC	Community Health Centre
COO	Chief Operating Officer
CRS	Corporate Social Responsibility
CSF	Critical Success Factors
CSR	Corporate social responsibility
CT	Computed tomography
DH	District Hospital
ECHS	Ex-Servicemen Contributory Health Scheme
EFA	Exploratory Factor Analysis
eIRP	Efficient Interpretive Ranking Process
ENT	Ear, Nose, and Throat.
ESI	Employee State Insurance
GDP	Gross domestic product
GE	GE Healthcare-General Electric American company
HOD	Head Of Department
HRM	Human Resources Management

ICN	Infection Control Nurse
ICT	Information, Communication, Technology
ICTV	International Committee on Taxonomy of Viruses
ICU	Intensive Care Unit
IMR	Infant mortality rate
IOL	Intraocular Lens
IPD	Inpatient Department.
ISM	Interpretive structural modeling
JCI	Joint Commission International
KMO	Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin
LMICs	Low- And Middle-Income Countries
MBBS	Bachelor of Medicine and Bachelor of Surgery
MC	Medical college
MHFW	Ministry Of Health and Family Welfare
MIC MAC	Impact Matrix Cross-Reference Multiplication Applied to a Classification
MMR	Measles, Mumps, Rubella
MRI	Magnetic resonance imaging
NABH	National Accreditation Board for Hospitals & Healthcare Providers
NABL	National Accreditation Board for Testing and Calibration Laboratories
NO	Nursing Officers
NRHM	National Rural Health Mission
NSDC	National Skill Development Corporation
NSSO	National Sample Survey Office
OPD	Out Patient Department
P&L	Profit and Loss
PAF	Principal Axis Factoring
PCA	Principal Component Analysis
PCC	Patient and Cancer Care
PCTC	Patient Centered Team Care

PH Model	Primary health Model
PHC	Primary Health Centre
PHCE	Primary Healthcare Engagement
PPP	Public–private partnership
PROI-PT	Professional Role Orientation Inventory for Physical Therapists
SAPLAP	Situation Actor Process – Learning Action Performance
SHI	Social Health Insurance
SPSS	Statistical Package of Social Sciences
T2DM	Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus
TISM	Total Interpretive Structural Modeling
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America
USD	US Dollar
WHO	World Health Organization.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE.....	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
सारांश.....	v
KEYWORDS AND LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED.....	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	x
LIST OF TABLES.....	xvi
LIST OF FIGURES	xvii

CHAPTER-1

INTRODUCTION	1-18
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Research area	2
1.3 Issues in healthcare delivery in India.....	3
1.4 Examples of hospitals which adopted generic competitive strategies	5
1.5 Challenges in the delivery of low-cost healthcare	6
1.6 Justification of research dimension.....	9
1.7 Summary of the chapter	18

CHAPTER - 2

LITERATURE REVIEW	19-46
2.1 Introduction.....	19
2.2 Literature review on the objective to identify the critical success factors for low-cost healthcare delivery using TISM methodology	22
2.3 Literature reviews on the objective to cluster the identified 40 factors using the exploratory factor analysis.....	33
2.4 Literature review on the low-cost healthcare model of selected organization using SAP-LAP model.....	36
2.5 Literature review on the objective to assess the cost-effective performance of a healthcare organization during Covid 19 using SAP-LAP framework.....	37

2.6	Literature review on the objective on Low-cost healthcare: Policies and analysis of healthcare insurance schemes	39
2.7	Significance of This Research Area	41
2.8	Few best practices for low-cost healthcare delivery	42
2.9	Barriers for Implementing best practice.....	44
2.10	Gaps Identified in the literature.....	45
2.11	Summary of the Chapter	46

CHAPTER-3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY 47-58

3.1	Introduction	47
3.2	Research question.....	47
3.3	Research objectives	47
3.4	Research outlay	48
3.5	Tools used	49
3.5.1	Rating scale of identified extensive factors for low-cost healthcare delivery in India.....	49
3.5.2	Observational checklist to identify the low-cost healthcare model of LV prasad eye Institute	49
3.5.3	Questionnaire to assess the opinion of respondents to the situations, process, learning, actions taken and performance in LV prasad eye Institute.	49
3.5.4	Questionnaire to assess the cost-effective performance of a healthcare organization during Covid 19.	50
3.5.5	Questionnaire Understanding consumer perceptions about cost components of various healthcare insurance schemes	50
3.6	TISM & MICMAC Methodology	51
3.6.1	Introduction	51
3.6.2	Characteristics of TISM	51
3.6.3	Steps in TISM.....	51
3.7	EFA	52
3.7.1	Introduction	52
3.7.2	Characteristics of exploratory factor analysis	53
3.7.3	Steps in EFA.....	53

3.8	SAP-LAP	55
3.8.1	SAP LAP Framework.....	56
3.9	‘t’ Test and One-Way ANOVA	57
3.10	Summary of the chapter	58
CHAPTER-4		
MODELLING CRITICAL SUCCESS FACTORS FOR LOW-COST HEALTHCARE..... 59-73		
4.1	Introduction and background	59
4.2	Research questions	60
4.3	Research objective	61
4.4	Research methodology	61
4.5	Data analysis	62
4.6	Model building	63
4.7	Discussion and conclusion	72
4.8	Chapter summary	73
CHAPTER-5		
CLUSTERING OF FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO LOW-COST HEALTHCARE DELIVERY USING EFA 74-93		
5.1	Introduction and background	74
5.2	Research question	75
5.3	Research objective	75
5.4	Research methodology	75
5.4.1	Factors responsible for contributing to low-cost healthcare deliveries..	76
5.5	Factor analysis.....	84
5.6	Communality.....	84
5.7	Factor loading	86
5.8	Principal components analysis (PCA).....	86
5.9	Scree plot.....	88
5.10	Kaiser-Meyer-Olkin (KMO) test for sampling adequacy	89
5.11	Bartlett’s Test of Sphericity	90

5.12	Analysis and result	90
5.13	Discussion and conclusion	92
5.14	Chapter summary	93

CHAPTER-6

ANALYSIS OF LOW-COST HEALTHCARE DELIVERY OF AN EYE HEALTHCARE ORGANIZATION USING SAP-LAP FRAMEWORK..... 94-106

6.1	Introduction and background	94
6.2	Research questions	95
6.3	Research objective.....	95
6.4	Research methodology	95
6.5	Analysis and result	99
6.6	Discussion and conclusion	104
6.7	Chapter summary	106

CHAPTER 7

A CASE STUDY ON ORGANIZATIONAL PERFORMANCE DURING COVID-19 USING SAP-LAP FRAMEWORK..... 107-130

7.1	Introduction and background of the study.....	107
7.2	Need and significance	108
7.3	Significance of flexible system management during Covid	109
7.4	Research questions	109
7.5	Research objective.....	110
7.6	Research methodology	110
7.7	Analysis and result	112
7.8	Discussion and summary.....	127
7.9	Chapter summary	130

CHAPTER-8

HEALTHCARE COST REDUCTION AND HEALTH INSURANCE POLICY IMPROVEMENT..... 131-141

8.1	Introduction and background	131
8.2	Research question.....	133

8.3	Research objective	133
8.4	Research gaps, hypothesis, and methodology.....	133
8.4.1	Survey tool	134
8.4.2	Research hypotheses and testing methodology	135
8.5	Analysis and results	135
8.6	Discussion and conclusion	139
8.7	Chapter summary	141

CHAPTER 9

CONCLUSIONS, RESEARCH IMPLICATIONS, LIMITATION AND FURTHER RESEARCH DIRECTIONS 142-151

9.1	Introduction.....	142
9.2	Implications of the study.....	142
9.2.1	Implication of the study to identify the critical success factors for low-cost healthcare delivery using TISM methodology	142
9.2.2	Implication of the study to cluster the critical success factor for low-cost healthcare delivery using EFA	144
9.2.3	Implication of the study to identify the low-cost healthcare model of selected organization using SAP-LAP model.....	145
9.2.4	Implication of the study on organizational performance during Covid-19 using SAP-LAP framework	146
9.2.5	Implication of the study on healthcare cost reduction and health insurance policy improvement.	147
9.3	Limitations and directions for future research	148
9.3.1	Limitations and directions for future research of the study to identify the critical success factors for low-cost healthcare delivery using TISM methodology	148
9.3.2	Limitations and directions for future research of the study to cluster the critical success factor for low-cost healthcare delivery using EFA.....	149
9.3.3	Limitations and directions for future research of the study to identify the low-cost healthcare model of selected organization using SAP-LAP model	149
9.3.4	Limitations and directions for future research of the study on organizational performance during Covid-19 using SAP-LAP framework	150

9.3.5	Limitations and directions for future research of the study on healthcare cost reduction and health insurance policy improvement...	150
9.4	Chapter summary	151
REFERENCES.....		152-172
APPENDIX.....		173-202
ABOUT THE AUTHOR		203

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: Porter’s five forces analysis in healthcare.	4
Table 1.2: Generic competitive strategies.	5
Table 2.1: Literature review	25
Table 2.2: Classification of extensive factors identified in three dimensions.	28
Table 2.3: Area-wise literature review	33
Table 2.4: Healthcare cost categories in available literature	41
Table 3.1: Research objectives, methodology, tool, setting and remarks.....	48
Table 4.1: Potential critical success factors, expert rating, and t-test results (threshold value 3	63
Table 4.2: Self-Interaction matrix of 15 low-cost healthcare critical success factors (LCHF)	65
Table 4.3: Initial reachability matrix of critical success factors for low-cost healthcare.....	66
Table 4.4: Final reachability matrix of LCHF showing transitivity as well as the dependence and driving power of each factor.....	67
Table 4.5: Reachability sets, antecedent sets, intersection sets and level partitioning of low-cost healthcare factors	68
Table 5.1: Factors contributing to low-cost healthcare delivery	79
Table-5.2: Potential critical success factors, expert rating, and t-test results (threshold value 3).....	83
Table 5.3: Communalities.....	85
Table 5.4: Extraction method: Principal component analysis.	86
Table 5.5: Extraction Method: Principal Component Analysis.....	88
Table 5.6: KMO and bartlett's Test.....	90
Table 5.7: Factors extracted as Cluster factors	91
Table 6.1: Depicts operational excellence using SAP LAP	100
Table 6.2: Depicts clinical excellence using SAP LAP.....	102
Table 6.3: Depicts educational excellence using SAP LAP.....	103
Table 7.1: SAPLAP model of converting non covid hospital to covid hospital.....	125
Table 8.1: Research steps	134
Table 8.2: Descriptive statistics of patient feedback	137
Table 8.3: ANOVA of 4 health insurance policy options for different healthcare costs.....	138

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Advantages of India for low-cost healthcare delivery	2
Figure 2.1: Task shifting paradigm.....	42
Figure 3.1: SAP LAP Framework	57
Figure 4.1: TISM model of low-cost healthcare delivery factors.....	70
Figure 4.2: MICMAC analysis of low-cost healthcare delivery factors.....	71
Figure 5.1: Scree plot.....	89
Figure 6.1: SAP-LAP model explaining the formulation of SAP and LAP.....	97
Figure 6.2: Shows the pyramidal model of care	98
Figure 6.3: SAP-LAP model explaining operational excellence of LVPEI	101
Figure 6.4: SAP-LAP model explaining clinical excellence of LVPEI	102
Figure 6.5: SAP-LAP model explaining educational excellence of LVPEI.....	104
Figure 7.1: Depicting the national covid trend	108
Figure 7.2: SAP-LAP framework: Source: Sushil (2001a)	112
Figure 7.3: SAP-LAP model formation with nine situations	119
Figure 7.4: SAPLAP model- I	120
Figure 7.5: SAPLAP model- II.....	121
Figure 7.6: SAPLAP Model- III	122
Figure 7.7: SAPLAP model- IV	123
Figure 7.8: SAPLAP model- V.....	124