

**CITIZENS' ACCEPTANCE OF GOVERNMENT'S
ONLINE SERVICES:
A STUDY OF TWO INDIAN CONTEXTS**

AMITABH OJHA



**DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT STUDIES
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI**

JULY 2009

**CITIZENS' ACCEPTANCE OF GOVERNMENT'S
ONLINE SERVICES:
A STUDY OF TWO INDIAN CONTEXTS**

By

AMITABH OJHA

Department of Management Studies

Submitted

In fulfillment of the requirements for the award of degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

to the



INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

JULY 2009

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the thesis entitled **“CITIZENS’ ACCEPTANCE OF GOVERNMENT’S ONLINE SERVICES: A STUDY OF TWO INDIAN CONTEXTS”**, being submitted by Mr. AMITABH OJHA to the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi, for the award of the degree of DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY (Ph.D.), is a record of bona fide research work carried out by him. He has worked under my supervision, and has fulfilled the requirements for the submission of this thesis, which is in accordance with the standards required for a Ph.D. degree of the institute. The results contained in it have not been submitted in part or full to any other university or Institute for award of any degree/diploma.

(Prof. M. P. Gupta)

Research Supervisor

Department of Management Studies

Indian Institute of Technology Delhi, India

Dated: July , 2009

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In my doctoral study, I have greatly benefited from the inspiration and support of several individuals. While I have tried my best to identify those individuals and express my gratitude to them, I do apologize for any inadvertent omissions.

First and foremost, I express my deep gratitude to my supervisor Prof. M. P. Gupta for his guidance and inspiration. He was always positive, encouraging, accessible for consultations, and has spent endless hours in imparting innovative ideas and in reviewing my work. He set me on a journey of search and discovery, a journey that is very much an end in itself.

Second, I gratefully acknowledge the support I received from other academics. As regards Indian Institute of Technology Delhi, my thanks go to Prof. S. S. Yadav, Prof. Vinayshil Gautam, and Prof. Harish Chaudhry for their inspiration and support. I particularly thank Prof. Sushil, Prof. S. G. Deshmukh, Prof. Ravi Shankar, and Prof. K. Momaya for their comments which have greatly helped in improving the research plan and the dissertation. In addition, I also thank Prof. I. Vigneswara for his valuable inputs on research methodology. My thanks are also due to Prof. M. D. Singh and Prof. G. P. Sahu of National Institute of Technology, Allahabad (India) for their help at various stages of my research.

Third, my thanks are due to several practitioners who have helped in my research. In this regard, I gratefully acknowledge the support I received from Mr Ramesh Krishnamurthi of Directorate General of Income Tax (Systems); Dr. Nalin Shinghal, Ms. Rajni Hasija, and Mr. V. S. Negi of Indian Railway Catering and Tourism Corporation Ltd. (IRCTC); and Mr. S. S. Mathur of Centre for Railway Information System (CRIS).

Fourth, I must thank the railway authorities who were helpful in sanctioning me a three years leave of absence from railway service, for pursuing the Ph. D. programme as a full-time student. For this support, I would always remain indebted to Research Designs and Standards Organization's (RDSO) Director General, Mr. H. S. Pannu. I am

equally grateful to Mr. Kulbhushan and Mr Pramod Kumar, both former Executive Directors, Indian Railway Centre for Advanced Maintenance Technology.

Fifth, I thank the following scientific/ non-scientific officials and fellow research scholars at IIT Delhi who have been a source of constant support in my research: Dr. C. V. Singh, Mr. Vimal Kumar, Mr. V. J. Thomas, and Mr. Rohit Joshi.

Last but not the least, I express my gratitude to my family members for their unflinching support throughout these three years.

July , 2009
New Delhi

Amitabh Ojha

ABSTRACT

Today, governments across the globe are according high priority to improving the delivery of information and services to citizens, businesses, and other stakeholders. In this regard, Information and Communication Technology (ICT) has emerged as a cost effective tool. Indeed, automation is now a key component in an increasing number of administrative reform programs. But in developing or transitional countries, the high failure rate of e-government projects means that the task of administrative reform through ICT is by no means simple. In this regard, citizens' large-scale acceptance of government-to-citizen (G2C) online services is essential to the success of ICT led reforms targeted at servicing the citizens in a better manner. A key constraining factor for such reform initiatives is the digital divide, which inevitably keeps a large number of citizens away from government's online services. But then there are also the citizens who have the internet skill as well as access to requisite resources, and yet they don't use G2C online services. So, in addition to efforts at mitigating the digital divide problem, it is also important to take steps as would cause the citizens having internet skills and access to requisite resources, to voluntarily take to G2C online services. This research addresses the latter challenge.

The dissertation starts with introductory material i.e. background, the concept of e-government and e-governance, India's e-government program, motivation for research, outline of the study, and organization of the dissertation itself. To develop the detailed agenda for this research, literature has been reviewed in the following areas: theoretical bases of technology acceptance and associated empirical studies; perceived value; role of perceived value in technology acceptance; evolution, classification, and general critiques on e-government writings; and e-government acceptance. The review of literature has helped to identify the following five limitations of G2C e-government acceptance studies: developing country context remains largely ignored; studies are skewed in favor of two theories i.e. Technology Acceptance Model and Theory of Planned Behavior; trust has been treated as unidimensional and its measures (items) use complex terms e.g. 'trust', and 'trustworthiness', terms that are difficult to interpret in an unequivocal manner; adopter bias (survey of individuals who already use an e-government service); and the impact of user charges and/or other monetary costs on

citizens' intention to use G2C online services, has not been empirically investigated. In addition, a knowledge gap arising from the preceding limitations is the lack of empirical evidence on the ability of perceived characteristics of innovating and trustworthiness constructs to explain citizens' intention to accept e-government services in India and possibly other developing countries. Keeping in view the limitations of previous research, empirical studies were carried out in two Indian contexts i.e. paperless income tax e-filing, and rail e-ticketing. Surveys for these studies were administered at two technical universities in North India i.e. Indian Institute of Technology Delhi and National Institute of Technology, Allahabad.

In the first study, a sub-set of perceived characteristics of innovating and relevant trustworthiness constructs are posited as antecedents of young (salaried) professionals' intention to use income tax e-filing. This e-government service does not attract user charges. Ordinary least squares (OLS) regression results show that the following explanatory variables (in descending order of t-statistic) exercise a significant effect on citizens' usage intention: compatibility, personal innovativeness in Information Technology, perceived ease of use, relative advantage, and performance of e-filing service (technology). The effect of variables image and helpline competency was non-significant. The model explains 46.9% of the variance in citizens' intention to use the paperless income tax filing service.

The second study addresses citizens' acceptance of pay-to-use G2C online services. The study is situated in Indian Railways' e-ticketing context; this online service attracts user charges. To model citizens' intention to utilize pay-to-use G2C online service (in preference to traditional service delivery which does not attract user charges), this study has drawn on the perceived value – behavioral intention framework from marketing literature. OLS regression estimates show that the following explanatory variables (in descending order of t-statistic) have a significant effect on citizens' intention to use electronic service delivery: value perceived in traditional service delivery channel; functional value (price/value for money) perceived in electronic channel; and social value perceived in electronic channel. The effect of functional value (performance/quality) perceived in electronic channel has very narrowly missed the statistical significance threshold. The model explains 38.7% of the variance in citizens' intention to use the rail e-ticketing service.

At the level of theory, the first study shows that: perceived characteristics of innovating can reasonably explain citizens' e-government acceptance behavior in Indian settings; and that the continuing problem of discriminant validity between *compatibility* and *relative advantage* can be solved if the measures of *compatibility* are guided by the current research with regard to the conceptualization and operationalization of the latter construct. Further, results of the second study show that the perceived value – behavioral intention framework can be gainfully used to explain citizens' acceptance of pay-to-use G2C online services. The studies' managerial implications can guide managers in promoting the use of income tax e-filing and rail e-ticketing services. Policy implications of the study address broader issues related to citizens' acceptance of G2C online services and user charges. Research implications of the studies should help to improve the specification and design of subsequent G2C e-government acceptance studies and steer future research effort in more useful directions.

Towards the end, the research questions have been re-visited and the key learnings, as they emerge from a synthesis of the two empirical studies, are presented. As in any other study, this research too has some limitations and the same have been acknowledged. Possible avenues of future work have been delineated.

Contents

Abstract	i
Contents	iv
List of Figures	x
List of Tables	xi
List of Abbreviations Used	xiii

Chapter 1

Introduction to the Study

1.1 Background	1
1.2 What is e-government	3
1.2.1 Definition of e-government	3
1.2.2 Category of e-government services	7
1.2.3 E-government and E-governance	9
1.3 E-Government in India	10
1.3.1 India's National E-Governance Plan (NeGP)	13
1.3.2 Impact assessment of NeGP projects	15
1.4 The motivation for research	17
1.5 Outline of the study	19
1.6 Organization of Thesis	21
1.7 Concluding Remarks	22

Chapter 2

Literature Review

2.1	Introduction	23
2.2	Social Psychology theories in Technology Acceptance	23
2.2.1	Theory of Reasoned Action	24
2.2.2	Technology Acceptance Model	25
2.2.3	Theory of Planned Behavior	29
2.3	Innovation Diffusion theory in Technology Acceptance	31
2.4	Perceived Value and Technology Acceptance	33
2.4.1	Nature, Definition, and Dimensionality of Value	33
2.4.2	Perceived Value and Behavioral Intention	39
2.5	Classification and evolution of e-government literature	40
2.5.1	Classification of e-government literature	40
2.5.2	Evolution of e-government literature	41
2.6	E-government stage models	41
2.7	General critiques of e-government literature	45
2.8	E-government acceptance	48
2.8.1	E-government acceptance at organization level	48
2.8.2	E-government acceptance at individual (citizen) level	50
2.8.3	Citizens' monetary costs and G2C e-government acceptance	52
2.9	Limitations of G2C e-government acceptance research	56
2.10	Concluding Remarks	59

Chapter 3

Research Plan

3.1	Introduction	60
3.2	Problem Statement	60
3.3	Research Objectives	61
3.4	Research Questions	62
3.5	Conceptual Framework	63
3.6	Study context and scope	65
3.7	Research paradigms and epistemology	67
3.8	Overview of research methodology	71
3.8.1	Design of questionnaire	72
3.8.2	Testing and administration of questionnaire	74
3.8.3	Assessment of instrument validity and reliability	75
3.8.4	Testing of hypothesized paths	78
3.9	Concluding remarks	79

Chapter 4

Income Tax E-filing acceptance

4.1	Introduction	80
4.2	India's Direct Taxes' administrative set up	80
4.3	Income Tax Reforms, computerization, restructuring, and BPR	82
4.3.1	Income tax computerization, and its history in India	82
4.3.2	Restructuring of the Income-tax department	84

4.3.3 Business Process Re-engineering	84
4.4 E-government progress on the 4-stage growth model	85
4.5 Income Tax e-filing in India	88
4.6 Research Model and Hypotheses	91
4.7 Survey procedure and measures	99
4.7.1 Survey procedure	99
4.7.2 Measures used in the survey	102
4.8 Results and Discussion	103
4.8.1 Results	103
4.8.2 Discussion	108
4.9 Concluding remarks	110

Chapter 5

Pay-to-use G2C online services

5.1 Introduction	111
5.2 An overview of Indian Railways	112
5.3 A historical background of ICT in Indian Railways	113
5.4 E-government progress on the 4-stage growth model	116
5.5 Indian Railways' passenger reservation system	118
5.6 E-ticket service of Indian Railways	121
5.7 Research Model and Hypotheses	123
5.7.1 Value perceived by citizens in the electronic channel	123
5.7.2 Value perceived by citizens in traditional service delivery channel	126

5.8	Survey procedure and measures	127
5.8.1	Survey procedure	127
5.8.2	Measures used in the survey	129
5.9	Results and discussion	131
5.9.1	Results	131
5.9.2	Discussion	134
5.10	Concluding Remarks	135

Chapter 6

Implications for Practice and Research

6.1	Introduction	137
6.2	Implications of income tax e-filing study	137
6.2.1	Managerial Implications (income tax e-filing)	137
6.2.2	Implications for Policy (income tax e-filing)	140
6.2.3	Implications for Research (income tax e-filing)	141
6.3	Implications of study on pay-to-use G2C online services	144
6.3.1	Managerial Implications (pay-to-use G2C online service)	144
6.3.2	Implications for Policy (pay-to-use G2C online service)	145
6.3.3	Implications for the citizen (pay-to-use G2C online service)	150
6.3.4	Implications for research (pay-to-use G2C online service)	152
6.4	Limitations and future work (income tax e-filing)	153
6.5	Limitations and future work (pay-to-use G2C online service)	155
6.6	Concluding Remarks	157

Chapter 7

Conclusion

7.1	Introduction	159
7.2	Summary of the research	159
7.3	Revisiting research questions and methodology	160
7.3.1	Research questions revisited	160
7.3.2	Research methodology revisited	164
7.4	Key learnings from a synthesis of the two studies	165
7.5	Significant Research Contributions	168
7.6	Closing Remarks	170
References		171-189
Appendix I	Questionnaire for income tax e-filing survey	A1-A4
Appendix II	Questionnaire for rail e-ticketing survey	A5-A8