

ESSAYS ON MIDDLE CLASS IN INDIA

R.AHALYA



DEPARTMENT OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

JUNE 2021

©Indian Institute of Technology Delhi (IITD), New Delhi, 2021

ESSAYS ON MIDDLE CLASS IN INDIA

by

R. AHALYA

Department of Humanities and Social Sciences

Submitted

In fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

to the



INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

June 2021

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the thesis titled **ESSAYS ON MIDDLE CLASS IN INDIA**, submitted by **R. Ahalya**, to the Indian Institute of Technology, Delhi, for the award of the degree of **Doctor of Philosophy**, is a bona fide record of the research work done by her under our supervision. The contents of this thesis, in full or in parts, have not been submitted to any other Institute or University for the award of any degree or diploma.

Prof. Sourabh Bikas Paul

Assistant Professor

Dept. of Humanities and Social Sciences

IIT-Delhi, 600 036

Prof. V. Upadhyay

Adjunct Professor

Dept. of Humanities and Social Sciences

IIT-Delhi, 600 036

Place: New Delhi

Date: 14th June 2021

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In this journey of my Ph.D, the most important person has been my supervisor, Prof. Sourabh Paul. Throughout he has been supportive, and taught me the skills to be a researcher. It will not be an exaggeration to say that without his support, I could not have pursued research and completed my thesis. I would also want to sincerely thank my co-supervisor Prof. Upadhyay, and all economics faculty at the department, Prof. Debasis Mondal, Prof. Ankush Aggarwal, Prof. Reetika Khera, Prof. Jayan Jose Thomas, Prof. Saptarshi Mukherjee, and Prof. Sisir Debnath, for their constant support, guidance, and encouragement during the course of my PhD. I would also like to thank faculty from other disciplines for their useful feedback on my research. I am also grateful to Prof. Sanil and Prof. Purnima Singh for enabling the progress of my Ph.D at every crucial stage. I am extremely thankful to all the administrative staff at IIT Delhi, particularly Monika and Neelam ma'am, for their patience and cooperation throughout, in facilitating the process of my PhD.

A special note of thanks to my friends in economics, Neha, Deeksha, Taniya, Asmita, Ruhi, Ekta, Sitakanta, Sandeep, Jayesh, Neise, Diti, Rituparna, Prakriti, Nikeata, Vandita, Satheesha, and all others for their academic as well as psychological support. I am thankful to all my peers at IIT, across disciplines, who made my life as a Ph.D student more enjoyable, and also inspired me to explore areas beyond my discipline. I am also thankful to all the organizers and participants at the conferences and workshops where I presented my work, for giving me valuable inputs (ISI Delhi, Azim Premji university, IGIDR, among others).

Finally, my thanks to my parents, whose constant support, love, and encouragement helped me to achieve this milestone.

ABSTRACT

In this thesis, we attempt to identify and characterize middle class, and look into several aspects of the middle class related to economic growth, consumption, and urban infrastructure. This thesis delves into the task of giving a shape and form to the idea of middle class, and analyses the issues pertaining to it. At the time of independence, majority of the Indians were poor, and the middle class comprised of a miniscule section of the society mostly consisting of government employees. Since liberalization, however, the Indian middle class has been growing both in terms of number as well as its share in the population. There have been various studies which estimate the Indian middle class as anywhere between five and ten percent of the population. In absolute numbers, the middle class is numerous enough to create a substantial impact on consumer demand, governance, and many other matters of political and economic significance, both at the national and global level.

Firstly, the problem of defining, and measuring the middle class is studied in the Indian context. All the existing approaches used in previous studies are analyzed to identify middle class across countries. We scrutinize each approach for its suitability in defining an Indian middle class. Given the income and wealth distribution that is constantly changing and evolving over time, the approach to measure middle class in India may be different from that used for developed nations. The social and cultural heterogeneity across regions in India further complicates the issue of using a single measure of middle class in India. It is almost impossible to characterize the middle class as one homogenous group of people, given the fluid and upwardly mobile nature of this class. Therefore, the agenda here is not to have one rigid and unchanging measure of middle class, but to analyze how the suitable approach to measure middle class may depend on the framework within which it is to be studied. A method of dividing households into different economic classes on the basis of consumption expenditure, durables possession, and land owned, is developed using the maximum likelihood algorithm, and it is compared with other existing methods.

Secondly, it is studied how middle is the middle class in India in terms of its various socioeconomic characteristics, and choices. The purpose here is to look at whether the economic middle class that is identified possesses traits that are in between that of the poor, and the rich. The traits which are studied here include religion, caste, occupation, education, and household size, among others. This is important because the middle class cannot be isolated as an economic category but has to be seen as a class that is shaped by the social and political nature of its being. It is supposedly the class that interrupts the

traditional Marxian dichotomy of the oppressor and the oppressed, and creates a channel for upward mobility based on individual merit. Hence, it is crucial to find out if the middle class that we define also stands in the middle in terms of its position, and behaviour in the society.

Thirdly, the consumption patterns of various goods and services for the Indian middle class is studied, and it is analyzed how this is different from the poor. In the global scenario, India is now projected as an important market for the consumption of food items, consumer durables, and different services. The emerging middle class will be the most important target for selling branded, and good quality products since it is growing in number, and can afford to look beyond fulfillment of basic needs, unlike the poor. We scrutinize the factors that drive the consumption of specific goods while shifting away from the consumption of others, as more and more people enter into middle class. This will enable us to suggest policy that will encourage consumer demand among the Indian middle class, and attract foreign investment in India. The focus in this chapter will be on the consumption on food items, and how the nature, and quality of food items preferred by the middle class differs from others.

Fourthly, the role of middle class in better economic performance of the country, and the creation of effective socio economic institutions, is analyzed. The middle class helps in economic development by acting as an active agent on both the demand, and the supply side of the economy. The emergence of a middle class has been found to create a more equitable society, and the establishment of a democratic polity. This helps in the creation of well functioning institutions in terms of superior administration, and efficiency. It also leads to the establishment of better quality, and more accessible provision of education, infrastructure, and health care. In a feudal society, comprising of the rich and the poor, these resources are appropriated by the top echelons of the society. On the other hand, a large, and upwardly mobile middle class supports equal opportunities and access to resources for all. These phenomena have already been studied, and validated by previous research. However, this study will look at whether the emerging Indian middle class actually facilitates them or it is merely guided by vested interests, without bringing any development.

Fifthly, it is studied how the households have transitioned out of poverty, and into the middle class. This gives us better insight on how the economic status of households are changing over time, and also how such changes vary across different regions in India. Further, we study the factors driving such movement of households into middle class. We particularly look at the effect of the urban infrastructure program JNNURM on such economic transitions. This is based on the premise that better infrastructure is instrumental in enabling upward economic mobility for households. This study will suggest the factors that help households in coming out of poverty, and entering the middle class, which is crucial for developing government policies for facilitating social welfare.

Finally, it is studied how infrastructure investment affects female labour force participation for the poor, lower class, and middle class. Here, female labour force participation is used as an indicator of the effectiveness of the infrastructure development program. We propose that increase in infrastructure investment has both demand and supply side effects on female labour force participation. This will enable us to study the interactions between economic class, and infrastructure investment on improving female labour force participation.

**KEYWORDS: Middleclass; Consumption; Economic Growth;
Infrastructure**

JEL classification: D; J; O; R

सारांश

इस थीसिस में, हम मध्यम वर्ग की पहचान करने और उसकी विशेषता बनाने का प्रयास करते हैं, और आर्थिक विकास, खपत और शहरी बुनियादी ढांचे से संबंधित मध्यम वर्ग के कई पहलुओं पर गौर करते हैं। यह थीसिस मध्यम वर्ग के विचार को एक आकार और रूप देने के कार्य में विशद जानकारी देता है, और इससे संबंधित मुद्दों का विश्लेषण करता है। आजादी के समय, अधिकांश भारतीय गरीब थे, और मध्यम वर्ग में समाज का एक लघु वर्ग शामिल था जिसमें ज्यादातर सरकारी कर्मचारी शामिल थे। लेकिन उदारीकरण के बाद से भारतीय मध्यम वर्ग संख्या के साथ-साथ जनसंख्या में अपनी हिस्सेदारी दोनों के लिहाज से बढ़ रहा है। ऐसे विभिन्न अध्ययन हुए हैं जो भारतीय मध्यम वर्ग को पांच से दस प्रतिशत आबादी के बीच कहीं भी अनुमानित करते हैं। निरपेक्ष संख्या में, मध्यम वर्ग राष्ट्रीय और वैश्विक दोनों स्तर पर उपभोक्ता मांग, शासन और राजनीतिक और आर्थिक महत्व के कई अन्य मामलों पर पर्याप्त प्रभाव पैदा करने के लिए पर्याप्त है।

पहला, मध्यम वर्ग को परिभाषित करने और मापने की समस्या का अध्ययन भारतीय संदर्भ में किया जाता है। दूसरे, यह अध्ययन किया जाता है कि भारत में मध्यम वर्ग अपनी विभिन्न सामाजिक-आर्थिक विशेषताओं और विकल्पों के संदर्भ में कितना मध्यम वर्ग है। तीसरा, भारतीय मध्यम वर्ग के लिए विभिन्न वस्तुओं और सेवाओं के उपभोग पैटर्न का अध्ययन किया जाता है, और यह विश्लेषण किया जाता है कि यह गरीबों से कैसे अलग है। चौथा, देश के बेहतर आर्थिक प्रदर्शन में मध्यम वर्ग की भूमिका और प्रभावी सामाजिक आर्थिक संस्थानों के निर्माण का विश्लेषण किया जाता है। पांचवां, यह अध्ययन किया जाता है कि कैसे परिवारों ने गरीबी से बाहर निकाला है, और मध्यम वर्ग में। इससे हमें इस बारे में बेहतर जानकारी मिलती है कि समय के साथ परिवारों की आर्थिक स्थिति कैसे बदल रही है, और यह भी कि भारत में विभिन्न क्षेत्रों में इस तरह के परिवर्तन कैसे भिन्न होते हैं। अंत में, यह अध्ययन किया जाता है कि बुनियादी ढांचे का निवेश गरीबों, निम्न वर्ग और मध्यम वर्ग के लिए महिला श्रम बल की भागीदारी को कैसे प्रभावित करता है।

Contents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	i
ABSTRACT	ii
LIST OF FIGURES	x
LIST OF TABLES	xii
1 INTRODUCTION	1
2 IDENTIFICATION AND CHARACTERIZATION OF MIDDLE CLASS	5
2.1 Literature Review	7
2.2 Different Approaches To Identify Middle Class	10
2.3 Data	15
2.4 Methodology	16
2.4.1 Consumption Expenditure Range	16
2.4.2 Mixtures Model	17
2.5 Results and Discussion	22
2.5.1 Consumption Expenditure Approach	22
2.5.2 Mixtures Model Approach	27
2.5.3 Robustness Check	32
2.5.4 Comparing The Results Of The Two Approaches	32
2.5.5 Conclusion	35
3 CONSUMPTION PATTERNS OF MIDDLE CLASS	36
3.1 Research Methodology	44
3.2 Preliminary Observations	46
3.3 Results And Discussion	48
3.4 Implications Of Middle Class Consumption	57

3.5	Conclusion	58
4	MIDDLE CLASS AND DEVELOPMENT IN INDIA	61
4.1	The Role Of Middle Class In India	62
4.2	Research Methodology	64
4.3	Data And Summary Statistics	66
4.3.1	Measuring Middle Class	66
4.3.2	Measuring Other Variables	66
4.3.3	Summary Statistics	69
4.4	Economic Outcomes And Middle Class	71
4.5	Institutional Outcomes And Middle Class	73
4.6	Validity Of The Instrumental Variables	75
4.7	Conclusion	83
5	MIDDLE CLASS AND URBAN INFRASTRUCTURE	85
5.1	Economic Mobility In India: An Assessment Of The JNNURM	88
5.1.1	Data and Methodology	89
5.1.2	State Wise Income Distributions and Economic Mobility	91
5.1.3	Economic Mobility and JNNURM Expenditure	92
5.2	The Effect Of Urban Infrastructure Development On Female Labour Force Participation Among The Poor, and Middle Class In India	94
5.2.1	Data and Methodology	96
5.2.2	Descriptive Analysis	98
5.2.3	Regression Results and Discussion	104
6	CONCLUSION	109
A	APPENDIX A	121
B	APPENDIX B	125
C	APPENDIX C	138
D	APPENDIX D	142

List of Figures

2.1	Economic class (%) distribution across religious categories.	24
2.2	Economic class (%) distribution across social groups (castes)	26
2.3	Pattern of ownership of individual durable goods (% of households owning the good)	28
2.4	Economic class composition (% of each class) of different religious groups using mixtures model.	30
2.5	Economic class composition of different social groups in mixtures model.	31
3.1	Share of different items in total per capita expenditure across class.	37
3.2	Sectoral composition of consumption patterns across classes.	40
3.3	Household expenditure on various durable goods.	43
3.4	Per capita share of various food components in total expenditure on food.	47
3.5	Price distribution for cereals and pulses.	49
3.6	Price distribution for milk, eggs, and meat.	50
3.7	Price distribution for fruits and vegetables.	51
3.8	Price distribution for served and packaged processed food.	52
4.1	Share of middle class during 1987-2011.	67
4.2	Distribution of middle class in Indian states and union territories.	70
4.3	Economic performance and middle class.	72
4.4	Institutional outcomes and middle class.	76
5.1	State wise per capita total expenditure on the JNNURM scheme.	87
5.2	Project completion rates for UIG.	88
5.3	Distribution of expenditure on water supply, buses, and dwellings (in crores of rupees).	100
5.4	Female labour force participation and economic class.	102
C.1	Correlation map of variables.	138

C.2 Relationship between middle class share and GDP per capita for selected states	139
E.1 Economic mobility across states.	147

List of Tables

3.1	Per capita expenditure on different items by class in 2011 (in rupees) . . .	39
4.1	GDP per capita and middle class share	73
4.2	GDP growth and middle class share	74
4.3	IMR and middle class	78
4.4	Life expectancy and middle class	79
4.5	Power losses (as a percentage of total power distribution) and middle class	80
4.6	Financial inclusiveness and middle class	81
4.7	Voter turnout ratio and middle class	82
5.1	Summary statistics	91
5.2	Marginal effects from probit regression	93
5.3	Proportion of districts having zero expenditure	99
5.4	Marginal effects of infrastructure expenditure on female labour force participation	104
5.5	Robustness check	106
A.1	Share of different rural employment categories across economic classes (%)	121
A.2	Share of different urban employment categories across classes (%)	121
A.3	Share of households with various levels of education across economic classes (% of rural households)	121
A.4	Share of households with various levels of education across economic classes (% of urban households)	122
A.5	Key features of the rural economic classes	122
A.6	Key features of the urban economic classes	122
A.7	Employment patterns of different economic categories (Rural)	123
A.8	Employment patterns of different economic categories (Urban)	123
A.9	The lower cut off for statewise middle class and the percentage of middle class across states	124

B.1	Rural lower class QUAIDS estimation	126
B.2	Urban lower class QUAIDS estimation	127
B.3	Rural middle class QUAIDS estimation	128
B.4	Urban middle class QUAIDS estimation	129
B.5	Rural upper class QUAIDS estimation	130
B.6	Urban upper class QUAIDS estimation	131
B.7	Rural lower class: income and price elasticities	132
B.8	Urban lower class: income and price elasticities	133
B.9	Rural middle class: income and price elasticities	134
B.10	Urban middle class: income and price elasticities	135
B.11	Rural upper class: income and price elasticities	136
B.12	Urban upper class: income and price elasticities	137
C.1	Summary statistics	141
C.2	Validity of the instrumental variables	141
D.1	Summary statistics	143
D.2	State wise female labour force participation	144
D.3	Probit regression results (marginal effects)	145