

**POST-CRASH ACCESSIBILITY
TO
CARE: THE CASE OF DELHI, INDIA**

RICHA AHUJA



TRANSPORTATION RESEARCH AND INJURY PREVENTION CENTER

INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

MAY 2022

© Indian Institute of Technology Delhi (IITD), New Delhi, 2022

**POST-CRASH ACCESSIBILITY
TO
CARE: THE CASE OF DELHI, INDIA**

by

RICHA AHUJA

Transportation Research and Injury Prevention Center

Submitted

**in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
to the**



INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

MAY 2022

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the thesis entitled “**Post-Crash Accessibility to Care: The Case of Delhi, India**” submitted by **Ms. Richa Ahuja** to the **Indian Institute of Technology, Delhi**, is a record of the bona-fide research work carried out by her under our supervision. The thesis, in our opinion, is worthy of consideration for the award of the degree of **Doctor of Philosophy** in accordance with the regulations of the Institute. The results embodied in the thesis have not been submitted to any other University or Institute for the award of any degree or diploma.

Dr. Geetam Tiwari
Professor
TRIP-C/Civil Eng. Dept.
IIT, Delhi, 110016

Dr. Niladri Chatterjee
Professor
Dept. of Mathematics
IIT, Delhi, 110016

Dr. Amit Gupta
Professor
Div. of Trauma Surg. & Crit. Care
JPNATC, AIIMS, Delhi, 110023

Date:

Place: New Delhi

Dedicated to God, my family, and all the road safety warriors.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

“The dream begins with a teacher who believes in you, who tugs and pushes and leads you to the next plateau, sometimes poking you with a sharp stick called truth.” – Dan Rather

I start by being grateful to God. By thy blessings, I got the best faculty advisors and the best learning environment in TRIP-C lab, IIT. Delhi.

Prof. Dinesh Mohan’s course on Road Safety gave me a whole new perspective of looking at things. Motivated by learning from him, I stepped into Prof. Tiwari’s office one day. I said, “I want to work in Road Safety,” Thus began my journey in this collaborative world of research, projects, and human impact. Every step at IIT has nurtured this research work. Prof. Tiwari’s class on transport economics made me re-think the macro and micro aspects of daily activities. Prof. Rao’s course on traffic made me embrace the modelling side of emergency operations. Dr. Nezammudin’s course on logistics drew me closer to the problem's supply chain and optimization side. Dr. Manoj’s course on data analysis made me re-think choices in an emergency. My interaction with Prof. A. Gupta led me to explore post-crash access to trauma care from a transport professional’s perspective. All my ideas drew closure with Prof. Chatterjee’s systematic teaching of statistics and stochastic processes, leading me to examine the stochasticity in emergency operations efficiently.

Mentorship and Interactions with Prof. Tiwari have had an extraordinary impact on my life. I have learned much more than just about professional pursuits from her. Her patience, perseverance, support, and trust have kept me going through the ups and downs of research. I look at her not just as my supervisor but as my guardian and my idol. I can’t be more grateful to have her in my life. Every time I got stuck, she helped me become a better version of myself, from difficult times of not getting permission for data collection in hospitals to working late hours to make sense of the data. I learned persistence, patience, perseverance, and hard work can solve life's most significant challenges. When I was about to give up on my Ph.D., she gave me endless support and asked me to give time to understand my issues and resolve them. When I was overwhelmed by the first-hand experience of trauma-related death in the trauma centre night visit, her kind advice of letting go of

things saved me from the mental trauma of that experience. She stood by me as no one else would. This space is very little to describe my regard for all she has been in my life.

The endless support of Prof. Chatterjee is undoubtedly the best thing that could happen to any Ph.D. student. Even though our limited interaction, he always offered continued emotional support. I can't be more thankful to him. Recalling little things that matter, his patiently listening to the ideas that lacked sense, and then helping me go in the right direction are unmatched. His advice about methods and execution has levelled up the quality of my work. Last-minute discussions, making speculations turn into good research content, letting me explore what more could be done, and not pushing me hard for things that were difficult to achieve within timelines are unmatched. His support is genuinely out of this world. He is like that ocean that welcomes the river into its expanse and gives away all it had to make the humble river into a vast ocean.

Super blessed, I got associated with fantastic personality and mentor- Prof. Gupta as my supervisor in the middle of my research work. His immense support has made this work truly diverse and relevant to even medical professionals. I could work in a whole new environment of trauma care with his efforts and support—this aided valuable research in understanding the access for the injured in a real-time environment. I am grateful for his help in getting ethical approval from AIIMS and permission from Sushruta Trauma Centre.

The second chapter of this thesis is a sub-part of a project, “Development of a taxi-based dispatcher-controlled EMS for low- and middle-income countries,” where Prof. Kavi Bhalla and Prof. Geetam Tiwari were Project Investigators. I got a chance to work with them on this project as a Ph.D. student. This collaboration led to the second chapter of this thesis from this work. This work's other objectives also developed due to the insights learned under their guidance, working with this fantastic team. I am indebted to Prof. Kavi Bhalla for his time and mentorship throughout my Ph.D. process. I learned from his rich experience in this research area. The small and significant aspects of this niche area which have now become my heart and soul, have been developed by working with him, visiting trauma centres, interviewing, and connecting with stakeholders. I can't be more grateful to my project teammates- Dr. Veena Sriram, Ms. Radhika Arora, Prof. Dinesh Mohan, Dr. Mathew Varghese, Prof. Girish Agrawal, and all the Stakeholders for sharing their valuable experience and to our transcriber Ms. Taruna Malhotra. Special thanks to Veena for training me in qualitative methods research, which has become an asset in life. I am also very

grateful to Radhika. Conducting interviews seemed like a more manageable task with her. Beyond work, these friendships earned during my Ph.D. are invaluable.

Multiple stakeholders have helped this work reach its present shape. I would like to thank the Accident research cell, the Deputy Commissioner of Police (DCP) in all the districts and special cells, and the staff of Delhi Police for helping me with the collection of the fatal crash - the first information reports from various departments and police stations. I am also thankful to DCP PCR- S D Mishra and Inspector Bhagwati Mishra in the office of DCP PCR for permitting me to use police control room records. I would also like to thank A.S.I. Narender and Inspector Tarun Grover at Central Police Control Room and all the Police Headquarter Staff for helping me understand the processes and providing me valuable support and data. I am highly thankful to the staff of the Health Ministry, particularly Mr. Sanjeev Khirwar, for his motivation in pursuing this work and for providing relevant permissions to use CATS ambulance data. I also express my gratitude to the CATS in charge - Mr. Laxman Rana, and the control room head, Mr. Shereddin Khan, for providing CATS ambulance operations-related information. I express my deepest gratitude to medical superintendent Dr. Ajay Bahl at Sushruta Trauma centre for allowing me to collect trauma centre data. I appreciate the medical records room staff- Mr. Lakra and Mr. Anil for all their valuable insights about medical records and terminology. I am thankful to Mr. Prateek for helping with the data collection at the trauma centre.

Many thanks to the Ministry of Human Resource Development (MHRD) for providing me the fellowship to pursue Ph.D. at IIT Delhi. I am grateful to Volvo Research Education Foundation for funding my attendance to MOBILIZE 2019. I thank SERB- Department of Science and Technology (DST) for recognizing my research work and granting me the International Travel Award. I am also thankful to IIT Delhi for recognizing my Ph.D. work as an excellent contribution to the field and awarding me the Research Excellence Travel Award (RETA). Special thanks to the National Institutes of Health (NIH) for funding the project to IIT Delhi and University of Chicago researchers. I am also thankful to all Civil Engineering faculty and staff and my student review committee members for their continued support and guidance throughout my Ph.D. work. My sincere thanks to the Institutional ethics committee of the IIT, Delhi, UChicago, US, and AIIMS Delhi, ICMR for continued mentorship and support in executing this work.

I appreciate the support of all the administrative and research staff at TRIP-C during all ups and downs of my Ph.D. life. Special thanks to the TRIP-C team: Ashok Sir for his sustained support and blessings, Suman Ma'am for being there in the most challenging times of my life, Hema Ma'am for all her prayers, and for introducing me to her spiritual side, giving me all the strength, I needed, Mahesh Ji for his blessings and encouraging support throughout, and Hari Ji for helping with all small-big things. I thank all my colleagues - Nishant, for extensive discussions over coffee. We together worked to make the transportation research forum a reality. We successfully brought together all of us to co-discuss what we believe is vital as professionals for the "Transport Forum." Thanks to Nilanjana, Sanjana, Hifzur, Ruchi, and many others who have been there throughout.

Thanks to my friends at IIT- Divya, Srishti, Diti, Neaketa, Prakriti, Shubhrima, Monali,, Deotima and many more who have been my family in the hostel. Long discussions with Anoop and Darius on campus were one of the best times spent on campus. Thanks to my National Service Scheme team and our mentor, Prof. Samrat Mukopadhyay, for his unconditional support. Thanks to my dance class friends with whom I have innumerable cherished memories.

I am grateful to my family: my loving mom (Mrs. Vijay Ahuja), my amazing dad (Mr. Gobind Ahuja), and the best brother possible (Mr. Rishabh Ahuja) for their unconditional support. My best friends, Darpan, Mohit, and Lavina, for all the motivation, help, support, and for sticking with me through the thick and thin of this journey.

I might have missed a lot of names, but my gratefulness doesn't impede. I want to thank all my IIT family, everybody I have interacted with, and those who have been the most valuable part of this incredible journey. Everything I am today due to these amazing people who chose to add value to my life through their presence. This space is not enough to name all the people who have contributed to my journey. I am sincerely grateful to all of you. Finally, I would dedicate this work and thesis to the supreme lord Krishna and surrender my future endeavours to the lord.

In Gratitude

Richa Ahuja

ABSTRACT

Road traffic crash injuries are the eighth leading cause of death in India (World Health Organization, 2015). About 50-75 % of the Indian population does not have access to an ambulance. Accessing care after a road traffic crash reduces the chances of injury aggravation and improves recovery time. Information about the existing system plays an important role in provisioning an efficient system. The annual operation cost of one ambulance is nearly \$53,000. Most low and middle-income countries (LMICs) cannot afford to establish and maintain such expensive systems. Half of the world's population resides in such LMICs where definitive care services operate with limited Health care infrastructure. The limited post-crash care resources necessitate optimum use of available resources. Ideally, post-crash transport must be done by an ambulance. But in resource-constrained countries, bystanders have prominently emerged as the first responders. Theoretically, access to care is a multi-dimensional term that includes aspects such as (a) availability, (b) accessibility (geographic), (c) accommodation, (d) affordability, (e) acceptability, and (f) awareness. Past attempts at estimating post-crash access and measuring emergency responders' performance have focused primarily on spatial and temporal aspects of access. Very few studies focussed on holistic evaluation consider the role of formal (ambulance) and informal responders (police and others) and such system wide operation of post-crash mechanisms of accessing care. There was a need to give due attention to all these factors, which eventually enable post-crash access to care. This thesis has attempted to bridge this research gap. It was demonstrated as a case study of Delhi. The work was developed with five objectives: the first objective was an in-depth qualitative assessment which gave a systems perspective of post-crash access to care in Delhi. The next four objectives were guided by insights from Objective 1. As identified from the literature review and behavioural theories of accessing care, these

emergency decisions were taken under duress and thus there wasn't any mode choice and hospital utilization model available in the context of post-crash access to care. The second objective derived the factors leading to these decisions through elaborate interviews with stakeholders and victims. These factors were used to model the post-crash utilization of care by different modes of transport. The third objective of this thesis estimated relative spatial access to one of the nearest hospitals or the trauma care system. It addressed the divided stakeholder views and policies about appropriate points of care for a crash victim and helps in deciding the on-site triage. In the fourth objective, the existing multi-modal post-crash operations were assessed using scenario analysis. An inclusive simulation-based framework was developed to accommodate the multi-modal nature of formal-informal response dynamics alongside the multi-dimensionality of accessibility in the current post-crash chain of events. It was demonstrated in the case of Delhi's Emergency Response Services. In the fifth objective, the use of already available commercial taxi resources was proposed to strengthen the existing ambulance operations in accordance with the international performance benchmarks.

Methodologically, this study used a mixed-methods approach. First, the literature review of the post-crash response system, synthesis of the available accessibility indicators, field observations, and informal conversations with stakeholders helped in identifying research gaps and developing a methodology for this thesis. It also formed the basis of qualitative research guides in the first objective, which was analysed using thematic analysis. In the second objective, post-crash mode choice and hospital care utilization were modelled using the structural constructs of Andersen's access to care framework and qualitative understanding from stakeholder interviews. The data was collected using a primary survey at the trauma centre. In the third objective, spatial access was assessed using four-year fatal crash data, and hospital information and travel time were calculated

using Google Maps API. The fourth objective used the Delhi-based ambulance and police operations data, taxi trajectory data, mode choice, hospital choice decision probability, etc. These inputs were used in the proposed framework based on the system-wide understanding of post-crash operations as described in Delhi through chapters one and two. The developed simulation framework assessed the response time and coverage characteristics of multiple proposed scenarios, accounting for the post-crash dynamics of multi-modal transportation and hospital decisions. This indicated an operationally important role of taxis in delivering patients to care. The fifth objective thus proposed to supplement ambulance operations with taxis. This was done using simulation-optimization methodology with the existing ambulance and taxi operations data.

Results from the first objective gave insights into the policies, processes, practices, and aspects of post-crash access to care. Ambulances, bystanders, taxis, and police play essential roles in enabling access to care. They were individually governed and guided by multiple laws and policies. The second objective identified education, financial status, help callers (bystanders & relatives), and injury severity as essential determinants of the post-crash use of a trauma care facility. Private transport, financial Status, education, injury severity, and status of care at the private hospital were significant determinants of receiving hospital-based care. The mode choice model finds bystanders as the primary informant of police transportation. Ambulance transportation gets accompanied by police personnel to the hospital. Ironically, information about emergency responders and having health insurance does not necessitate ambulance-based transport of the victims. The third objective found that the post-crash decision of taking the victim to a trauma care facility or one of the nearest hospitals is essentially a 15-minute difference for 90% of cases. As the triaging personnel often need to decide the type of care, this decision may account if the patient would survive these 15 minutes for better care in a trauma centre. Scenario analysis in the fourth objective showed the

importance of informal transportation in the overall post-crash access mechanism. Empirically, taxis and police emerged as significant responders to crash victims. The fifth objective factored in the critical role played by privately engaged taxi responders as enablers of post-crash access. The optimum ambulance to taxi configuration for capacity building of existing ambulance operations in response to the road traffic crashes was observed to be 1:4. The thesis brings out comprehensive estimates of multiple aspects of accessing care after a road traffic crash. Systematic framework-based assessment of post-crash response operations highlights the vital role of private vehicles in providing timely access. Neglecting them would create biases in actual access to care. Privately owned vehicles could be a precious resource in LMICs. Limited resources can be systematically supplemented with privately-owned taxis. If managed and integrated correctly, taxis can become an asset to ambulance operations. Post-crash accessibility insights in this thesis would be valuable information for the policymakers, ambulance providers, and the general body of knowledge. It holistically covers the functional intricacies of the system in the case of a road crash emergency. These aspects may be considered while planning, developing, and operating an emergency response system in India.

सार

सड़क यातायात दुर्घटना की चोटें भारत में मौत का आठवां प्रमुख कारण हैं (विश्व स्वास्थ्य संगठन, 2015)। लगभग 50-75% भारतीय आबादी के पास एम्बुलेंस तक पहुंच बहुत कम है। सड़क यातायात दुर्घटना के बाद देखभाल तक पहुँचने से चोट के बढ़ने की संभावना कम हो जाती है और ठीक होने में समय कम लगता है। कुशल प्रणाली के प्रावधान में मौजूदा प्रणाली के बारे में जानकारी एक महत्वपूर्ण भूमिका निभाती है। एक एम्बुलेंस की वार्षिक संचालन लागत लगभग \$ 53,000 है। अधिकांश निम्न और मध्यम आय वाले देश (LMIC) इस तरह की महंगी प्रणाली को स्थापित करने और बनाए रखने का जोखिम नहीं उठा सकते हैं। दुनिया की आधी आबादी ऐसे देशों में रहती है जहां निश्चित देखभाल सेवाएं सीमित स्वास्थ्य देखभाल बुनियादी ढांचे के साथ संचालित होती हैं। सीमित पोस्ट-क्रैश देखभाल संसाधनों के लिए उपलब्ध संसाधनों के इष्टतम उपयोग की आवश्यकता होती है। आदर्श रूप से, दुर्घटना के बाद यात्रा एम्बुलेंस द्वारा होना चाहिए। लेकिन संसाधन-विवश देशों में, बाईस्टैंडर्स प्रमुख रूप से पहले उत्तरदाताओं के रूप में उभरे हैं। सैद्धांतिक रूप से, देखभाल तक पहुंच एक बहु-आयामी शब्द है जिसमें निम्नलिखित पहलू शामिल हैं: (ए) उपलब्धता, (बी) पहुंच (भौगोलिक), (सी) आवास, (डी) सामर्थ्य, (ई) स्वीकार्यता, और (एफ) जागरूकता। दुर्घटना के बाद पहुंच का आकलन करने और आपातकालीन प्रतिक्रियाकर्ताओं के प्रदर्शन को मापने के पिछले प्रयासों ने मुख्य रूप से पहुंच के स्थानिक और अस्थायी पहलुओं पर ध्यान केंद्रित किया है। इसके अलावा, औपचारिक (पुलिस, और अन्य) और अनौपचारिक (एम्बुलेंस) उत्तरदाताओं की भूमिका सहित देखभाल तक पहुंचने के बाद दुर्घटना तंत्र के सिस्टम संचालन को समग्र रूप से देखने वाले कई अध्ययन नहीं हैं। इन सभी कारकों पर उचित ध्यान देने की आवश्यकता है जो अंततः दुर्घटना के बाद देखभाल तक पहुंच को सक्षम बनाते हैं। इस शोध प्रबंध ने इस शोध अंतराल को भरने का प्रयास किया है। इसे दिल्ली के मामले का अध्ययन के रूप में प्रदर्शित किया गया था। काम को पांच उद्देश्यों में विकसित किया गया था: पहला उद्देश्य एक गहन गुणात्मक

मूल्यांकन था जिसने दिल्ली में देखभाल के लिए दुर्घटना के बाद पहुंच का प्रणाली परिप्रेक्ष्य दिया।। अगले चार उद्देश्य, उद्देश्य एक से अंतर्दृष्टि द्वारा निर्देशित थे। जैसा कि साहित्य समीक्षा और देखभाल तक पहुँचने के व्यवहार सिद्धांतों से पहचाना जाता है, दुर्घटना के बाद के संदर्भ में कोई भी विकल्प और अस्पताल उपयोग पद्धति नहीं थी, क्योंकि दबाव में आपातकालीन निर्णय लिए जाते हैं। दूसरा उद्देश्य हितधारकों और पीड़ितों के साथ विस्तृत साक्षात्कार के माध्यम से इन निर्णयों के लिए अग्रणी कारकों को प्राप्त करता है। इन कारकों का उपयोग परिवहन के विभिन्न साधनों द्वारा देखभाल के दुर्घटना के बाद के उपयोग को मॉडल करने के लिए किया गया इस थीसिस का तीसरा उद्देश्य निकटतम अस्पताल या ट्रॉमा केयर सिस्टम के सापेक्ष स्थानिक पहुंच का अनुमान लगाता है। यह दुर्घटना के शिकार व्यक्ति की देखभाल के उपयुक्त बिंदुओं के बारे में विभाजित हितधारक के विचारों और नीतियों को संबोधित करता है। चौथे उद्देश्य में, मौजूदा मल्टी-मोडल पोस्ट-क्रैश ऑपरेशंस का परिदृश्य विश्लेषण का उपयोग करके मूल्यांकन किया गया था। घटनाओं की वर्तमान पोस्ट-क्रैश श्रृंखला में पहुंच की बहु-आयामीता के साथ-साथ औपचारिक-अनौपचारिक प्रतिक्रिया गतिशीलता की बहु-मोडल प्रकृति को समायोजित करने के लिए एक समावेशी सिमुलेशन-आधारित ढांचा विकसित किया गया था। इसका प्रदर्शन दिल्ली आपातकालीन प्रतिक्रिया सेवाओं के मामले में किया गया था। पांचवें उद्देश्य में, पहले से उपलब्ध टैक्सी संसाधन का उपयोग मौजूदा एम्बुलेंस संचालन को मजबूत करने के लिए प्रस्तावित किया गया था ताकि उनके संचालन को अंतरराष्ट्रीय प्रदर्शन बेंचमार्क के अनुसार बेहतर बनाया जा सके।

पद्धति की दृष्टि से इस अध्ययन में मिश्रित विधियों का प्रयोग किया गया है। सबसे पहले दुर्घटना के बाद प्रतिक्रिया प्रणाली की साहित्य समीक्षा, उपलब्ध पहुंच संकेतकों का संश्लेषण, क्षेत्र अवलोकन और हितधारकों के साथ अनौपचारिक बातचीत ने इस थीसिस के लिए अनुसंधान अंतराल की पहचान करने और कार्यप्रणाली विकसित करने में मदद की। इसने पहले उद्देश्य में गुणात्मक शोध गाइडों का आधार भी बनाया, जिसका

विश्लेषण विषयगत विश्लेषण का उपयोग करके किया गया था। दूसरे उद्देश्य में, दुर्घटना के मोड बाद विकल्प और अस्पताल देखभाल उपयोग को एंडरसन की देखभाल ढांचे के संरचनात्मक निर्माण और हितधारक साक्षात्कार से गुणात्मक समझ का उपयोग करके तैयार किया गया था। ट्रॉमा सेंटर में प्राथमिक सर्वेक्षण के उपयोग से डेटा एकत्र किया गया था। तीसरे उद्देश्य में, चार साल के घातक दुर्घटना आंकड़े और अस्पताल की जानकारी का उपयोग करके स्थानिक पहुंच का आकलन किया गया था और यात्रा के समय की गणना गूगल मैप्स एपीआई का उपयोग करके की गई थी। चौथे उद्देश्य में दिल्ली स्थित एम्बुलेंस और पुलिस संचालन आंकड़े, टैक्सी प्रक्षेपवक्र डेटा, मोड विकल्प और अस्पताल पसंद निर्णय संभावना इत्यादि का उपयोग किया गया था। इन आदानों का उपयोग प्रस्तावित ढांचे में दुर्घटना के बाद के संचालन की व्यवस्थित समझ के आधार पर किया गया था जैसा कि दिल्ली में अध्याय एक और दो के माध्यम से वर्णित है। विकसित सिमुलेशन ढांचे ने बहु-मॉडल परिवहन और अस्पताल के निर्णयों की दुर्घटना के बाद की गतिशीलता को ध्यान में रखते हुए, कई प्रस्तावित परिदृश्यों की प्रतिक्रिया समय और कवरेज विशेषताओं का आकलन किया। इसने मरीजों को देखभाल तक पहुंचाने में टैक्सियों की महत्वपूर्ण भूमिका का संकेत दिया। इसे ध्यान में रखते हुए, पांचवें उद्देश्य ने टैक्सी के साथ एम्बुलेंस संचालन को पूरक करने का प्रस्ताव रखा। यह मौजूदा एम्बुलेंस और टैक्सी संचालन आंकड़े के साथ अनुकरण-अनुकूलन पद्धति का उपयोग करके किया गया था।

पहले उद्देश्य के परिणामों ने नीतियों, प्रक्रियाओं, प्रथाओं और देखभाल के बाद दुर्घटना के बाद के पहलुओं में अंतर्दृष्टि प्रदान की। एम्बुलेंस, दर्शक, टैक्सी और पुलिस देखभाल तक पहुंच को सक्षम करने में आवश्यक भूमिका निभाते हैं। वे कई कानूनों और नीतियों द्वारा व्यक्तिगत रूप से शासित और निर्देशित होते हैं। दूसरे उद्देश्य ने शिक्षा, वित्तीय स्थिति, सहायता कॉल करने वालों (बाध्यकारी और रिश्तेदार), और चोट की गंभीरता को ट्रॉमा केयर सुविधा के दुर्घटना के बाद के उपयोग के आवश्यक निर्धारक के रूप में पहचाना। निजी परिवहन, वित्तीय स्थिति, शिक्षा, चोट की गंभीरता और निजी अस्पताल में देखभाल की स्थिति अस्पताल-

आधारित देखभाल प्राप्त करने के महत्वपूर्ण निर्धारक थे। परिवहन विकल्प मॉडल बाईस्टैंडर्स को पुलिस परिवहन के प्राथमिक मुखबिर के रूप में पाता है। एम्बुलेंस परिवहन पुलिस कर्मियों के साथ अस्पताल जाता है। विडंबना यह है कि आपातकालीन प्रतिक्रिया और स्वास्थ्य बीमा होने के बारे में जानकारी के बावजूद पीड़ित एम्बुलेंस आधारित परिवहन नहीं चुनते। तीसरे उद्देश्य में पाया गया कि दुर्घटना के बाद पीड़ित को ट्रॉमा केयर सुविधा या निकटतम अस्पताल में ले जाने का निर्णय अनिवार्य रूप से 90% मामलों में 15 मिनट का अंतर है। चूंकि ट्राइएजिंग कर्मियों को अक्सर देखभाल के प्रकार को तय करने की आवश्यकता होती है, इस उद्देश्य से बेहतर देखभाल चुनने के लिए मदद हो सकती है। चौथे उद्देश्य में परिदृश्य विश्लेषण ने समग्र पोस्ट-क्रैश एक्सेस तंत्र में अनौपचारिक परिवहन के महत्व को दिखाया। टैक्सी और पुलिस दुर्घटना पीड़ितों के लिए महत्वपूर्ण प्रतिक्रिया के रूप में उभरी। पांचवां उद्देश्य निजी तौर पर लगे टैक्सी उत्तरदाताओं द्वारा दुर्घटना के बाद पहुंच के समर्थक के रूप में निभाई गई महत्वपूर्ण भूमिका को दर्शाता है। सड़क यातायात दुर्घटनाओं के जवाब में मौजूदा एम्बुलेंस संचालन की क्षमता निर्माण के लिए इष्टतम एम्बुलेंस 1:4 देखा गया था।

थीसिस सड़क यातायात दुर्घटना के बाद देखभाल तक पहुँचने के कई पहलुओं का व्यापक अनुमान पेश करती है। दुर्घटना के बाद प्रतिक्रिया संचालन के व्यवस्थित ढांचे के आधार पर मूल्यांकन समय पर पहुंच प्रदान करने में निजी वाहनों की महत्वपूर्ण भूमिका पर प्रकाश डालता है। उनकी उपेक्षा करने से देखभाल की वास्तविक पहुंच में पक्षपात होगा। निम्न और मध्यम आय वाले देश जहां निजी स्वामित्व वाले वाहन एक बहुमूल्य संसाधन हो सकते हैं। निजी स्वामित्व वाली टैक्सियों के साथ सीमित संसाधनों को व्यवस्थित रूप से पूरक किया जा सकता है। अगर सही तरीके से प्रबंधित और एकीकृत किया जाए तो टैक्सी, एम्बुलेंस संचालन के लिए एक संपत्ति बन सकती है। इस थीसिस में दुर्गात्वा के उपरांत एक्सेसिबिलिटी अंतर्दृष्टि नीति निर्माताओं, एम्बुलेंस प्रदाताओं और ज्ञान के सामान्य निकाय के लिए मूल्यवान जानकारी होगी। यह सड़क दुर्घटना आपात

स्थिति के मामले में सिस्टम की कार्यात्मक जटिलताओं को समग्र रूप से कवर करता है। भारत में आपातकालीन प्रतिक्रिया प्रणाली की योजना, विकास और संचालन करते समय इन पहलुओं पर विचार किया जा सकता है।

CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE	i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iii
ABSTRACT	vii
सार	xi
LIST OF TABLES	xxi
LIST OF FIGURES	xxii
LIST OF EQUATIONS	xxv
GLOSSARY OF TERMINOLOGY	xxvi
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS/ACRONYMS	xxviii
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. LITERATURE REVIEW	4
1.1.1. Factors underlying access to care	4
1.1.2. Approach to measuring accessibility	7
1.2. EMERGENCY RESPONSE SYSTEM FOR ROAD TRAFFIC CRASHES	10
1.2.1. Centralized operation of post-crash response services	10
1.2.2. Workflow of the control room-based emergency response service	11
1.2.3. Importance of “time to care.”	12
1.2.4. Post-crash point of care	14
1.3. EMS PERFORMANCE MEASURES	14
1.4. INTERNATIONAL POLICIES, PROTOCOLS, AND GUIDELINES	15
1.4.1. Selection of appropriate hospital	15
1.4.2. Nearest hospital vs. Trauma centre	15
1.5. INDICATORS	16
1.5.1. Performance indicators of pre-hospital care	16
1.5.2. Access indicators for pre-hospital care	18
1.6. CRITICAL ISSUES IN PROVIDING PRE-HOSPITAL CARE	18
1.6.1. Post-crash response mechanisms in LMICs	19
1.6.2. Triage to appropriate care	20
1.7. STUDY CONTEXT	20
1.7.1. Post-crash responders in India	20
1.7.2. Financial assistance	21
1.7.3. Trauma care levels in India	21
1.7.4. Medico-Legal aspects	23
1.8. CASE DESCRIPTION	23
1.8.1. Case-based research design	23
1.9. THE CASE OF DELHI, CAPITAL OF INDIA	24
1.9.1. Post-crash responders in Delhi	24
1.9.2. Health care system and referral system in Delhi	25

1.9.3. Justification for the case of Delhi	26
1.9.4. Aims and Guidelines for Emergency Response Operations in Delhi	28
1.10. THESIS OBJECTIVES	29
1.11. THESIS RESEARCH DESIGN	30
1.11.1. Mixed-methods research	31
1.12. THESIS RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	32
1.12.1. Thesis structure	34
1.12.2. Continuity of research: Timeline of data collection	36
2. SYSTEM-WIDE UNDERSTANDING OF POST-CRASH MECHANISMS: PROCESSES, POLICIES, AND PRACTICES	38
2.1. OBJECTIVES	38
2.2. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODS	38
2.3. ETHICS STATEMENT	44
2.4. DATA COLLECTION	44
2.5. CHAPTER TWO METHODOLOGY	46
2.6. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	48
2.6.1. History of the post-crash response system	48
2.6.2. Information reception to police	49
2.6.3. Transport and transport type	50
2.6.4. Hospital selection	54
2.6.5. Appropriate hospital	54
2.6.6. Reception at the hospital	56
2.6.7. Delays at the hospital	58
2.6.8. Inter-hospital transfer: use of an ambulance for inter-hospital transfer	58
2.6.9. Hesitations	60
2.6.10. Integrated 112 system	60
2.7. CONCLUSION	61
2.8. RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION	63
2.9. LIMITATIONS AND WAY FORWARD	63
3. ESTIMATION OF FACTORS IMPACTING POST-CRASH DECISIONS FOR UTILIZATION OF CARE BY DIFFERENT MODES OF TRANSPORT	65
3.1. INTRODUCTION	65
3.2. OBJECTIVES	67
3.3. REVIEW OF THE THEORETICAL UNDERPINNINGS OF MODELLING ACCESS TO CARE	68
3.4. ETHICS STATEMENT	71
3.5. CHAPTER THREE METHODOLOGY	71
3.5.1. Study design and protocol	71
3.5.2. Development of questionnaire: Telephonic Interviews	73
3.5.3. Survey Sample Size Estimation	73
3.6. DATA COLLECTION	76
3.7. MODEL DEVELOPMENT	78
3.7.1. Deriving accessibility dimensions from the literature and the decision matrix of post-crash decisions	78
3.8. ANALYSIS	82
3.9. RESULTS	83

3.9.1. Patient Characteristics	83
3.9.2. Care facility utilization model	84
3.9.3. Post-crash mode choice model	90
3.10. DISCUSSION	91
3.10.1. Hospital care facility utilization	91
3.10.2. Mode of transport	92
3.11. CONCLUSION	93
3.12. RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION	94
3.13. LIMITATIONS AND WAY FORWARD	94
4. ASSESSMENT OF RELATIVE SPATIAL ACCESS BETWEEN A TRAUMA CARE OR A NEAREST HOSPITAL AFTER A ROAD TRAFFIC CRASH	96
4.1. INTRODUCTION	96
4.2. SUB-OBJECTIVES	97
4.3. CHAPTER FOUR METHODOLOGY	97
4.3.1. Study area	98
4.4. DATA COLLECTION	99
4.5. METHODS AND ANALYSIS	100
4.5.1. Inputs for API call	101
4.5.2. Travel time estimation	104
4.5.3. Dissimilarity Index (DI)	105
4.6. RESULTS	106
4.6.1. Crash distribution per district in Delhi	106
4.6.2. Travel time estimates to the trauma centre	106
4.6.3. Travel time estimates to the nearest hospital	106
4.6.4. Travel time comparison between a trauma centre and nearest hospital	107
4.6.5. Dissimilarity Index	108
4.7. DISCUSSION	109
4.8. CONCLUSION	113
4.9. RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION	114
4.10. LIMITATIONS AND WAY FORWARD	114
5. BENCHMARKING THE FORMAL POST-CRASH RESPONDERS AND DEVELOPING A FRAMEWORK TO MODEL THE CURRENT MULTI-MODAL EMERGENCY RESPONSE SYSTEM	116
5.1. INTRODUCTION	116
5.2. OBJECTIVES	118
5.3. CHAPTER FIVE METHODOLOGY	119
5.4. DATA COLLECTION AND PROCESSING	121
5.4.1. Data handling and Permissions	121
5.4.2. Ambulance log data	122
5.4.3. Police log data	126
5.4.4. Taxi log	129
5.4.5. Ambulance base	131
5.4.6. Police PCR van base	132
5.4.7. Hospitals	133
5.5. METHODOLOGY OF SUB-OBJECTIVES	133

5.5.1. First sub-objective: Benchmark formal emergency responders	133
5.5.2. Second sub-objective: Model daily crash log	135
5.5.3. Third sub-objective: parameters for simulation	136
5.5.4. Fourth sub-objective: Identification of taxi bases	137
5.5.5. Fifth sub-objective: Development of modelling framework	139
5.6. FRAMEWORK SPECIFICATION	140
5.6.1. Assumptions	140
5.7. FRAMEWORK INPUTS	141
5.7.1. Accident event log for one day	141
5.7.2. Pre-travel time delay and on-spot time delay distribution	146
5.7.3. Police PCR and Ambulance location, its availability per day	148
5.7.4. Taxi stay points and their availability per day	148
5.7.5. Hospital and trauma centre location	158
5.7.6. Travel time estimation method	158
5.7.7. Probability of using a mode of transport	159
5.8. SCENARIOS FOR FRAMEWORK DEMONSTRATION	159
5.8.1. Validation	159
5.8.2. Scenario analysis	159
5.9. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	160
5.9.1. Simulation reliability and validation	162
5.9.2. Benchmarking and scenario analysis	163
5.10. CONCLUSION	169
5.11. RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION	170
5.12. LIMITATIONS AND WAY FORWARD	170
6. DETERMINATION OF THE NUMBER OF TAXIS NEEDED TO STRENGTHEN THE EXISTING EMERGENCY MEDICAL SERVICE WITHIN INTERNATIONAL BENCHMARKS	173
6.1. INTRODUCTION	173
6.2. OBJECTIVES	175
6.3. DATA COLLECTION	175
6.3.1. Crash location	175
6.3.2. Taxi data	176
6.3.3. Travel time estimation	176
6.4. ASSUMPTIONS	177
6.5. INPUTS AND OUTPUTS OF THE MODEL	177
6.6. NUMBER OF ITERATIONS	178
6.7. SIMULATION-OPTIMIZATION METHODOLOGY	178
6.8. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	179
6.8.1. Response Time	179
6.8.2. Comparison of the simulation model with ambulance operations data	180
6.8.3. Total Travel Time	181
6.8.4. Coverage	182
6.8.5. Retrofitting of taxis for emergency transport	182
6.8.6. Other factors	183
6.9. CONCLUSION	183
6.10. RESEARCH CONTRIBUTION	184

6.11. LIMITATIONS AND WAY FORWARD	184
7. CONCLUSION OF THESIS	186
7.1. RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS	186
7.1.1. Contributions to the body of knowledge	187
7.1.2. Systems-level contribution	188
7.1.3. Policy and social contribution	189
7.1.4. Contribution to the Industry	190
7.2. RESEARCH HIGHLIGHTS	191
7.2.1. Understanding the post-crash access to care of a road crash victim	191
7.2.2. Assessment of the post-crash utilization and access to care by different modes of transportation	196
7.2.3. Estimating the relative spatial access to trauma care – nearest hospital system from road crash incident locations	199
7.2.4. Benchmarking the existing responders and developing a framework to model the current multi-modal emergency response system	201
7.2.5. Determination of the level of transportation means needed for strengthening the existing emergency medical service using taxis as a backup vehicle	205
7.3. RESEARCH CONTINUITY AND LINKAGE	206
7.3.1. Inputs for other objectives	206
7.3.2. Research tasks, methods, contributions, and implications	207
7.4. RECOMMENDATIONS	210
7.4.1. Post-crash response system	210
7.4.2. Healthcare system	212
7.4.3. Legal system	214
7.4.4. Capacity building	216
7.5. CONCLUDING REMARKS	218
7.6. FUTURE SCOPE OF WORK	219
8. REFERENCES	221
9. ANNEXURE1: ETHICS COMMITTEE APPROVALS	237
10. ANNEXURE 2: PARTICIPANT INFORMATION SHEET & INFORMED CONSENT	242
11. ANNEXURE 3: INTERVIEW GUIDES AND SURVEY FORM	247
12. ANNEXURE 4: CODEBOOK – CHAPTER 2	258
13. ANNEXURE 5: NIH CERTIFICATION- HUMAN SUBJECTS RESEARCH	265
14. LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	266
15. BIODATA OF AUTHOR	267

List of Tables

Table 1: Approach based measures of accessibility	9
Table 2: EMS performance indicators (Structure-Process-Outcome)	17
Table 3: Theoretical underpinnings of modelling access to care.....	68
Table 4: Survey sample size estimation.....	75
Table 5: Descriptive analysis of variables	85
Table 6: Trauma Centre utilization model.....	87
Table 7: Private hospital utilization model.....	88
Table 8: Mode choice model after road traffic crash.....	90
Table 9: District wise areas and their respective designated trauma centre	98
Table 10: Descriptive analysis of the nearest hospitals obtained from Google Maps API.....	102
Table 11: Dissimilarity Index between districts in Delhi	108
Table 12: General priority order of incidents responded by the ambulance.....	111
Table 13: Categories of calls received at the police control room.....	124
Table 14: Taxi trajectory data.....	130
Table 15: Specifications of Taxi GPS.....	130
Table 16: Categories to benchmark emergency response systems	134
Table 17: Emergency Medical Service Providers.....	160
Table 18: Call rate from police log file.....	161
Table 19: Response time results of all iterations	164
Table 20: Total travel time results of all iterations.....	164
Table 21: Research tasks, methods, contribution, and implications.....	208

List of Figures

Figure 1: Operation of emergency response service.....	11
Figure 2: Designated trauma care facility within each district of Delhi	25
Figure 3: Thesis methodology	32
Figure 4: Flow of research tasks within thesis methodology.....	33
Figure 5: Steps involved in a qualitative survey.....	39
Figure 6: Chapter two methodology	46
Figure 7: Post-crash decision matrix based on a stakeholder interview	61
Figure 8: Chapter three methodology	72
Figure 9: Private hospital utilization model.....	80
Figure 10: Trauma centre utilization model by the road injured	80
Figure 11: Chapter four methodology.....	98
Figure 12: District wise distribution of road traffic crashes	100
Figure 13: Spatial distribution of identified nearest hospitals	103
Figure 14: Identified nearest hospitals in north-west district.....	103
Figure 15: Identified nearest hospitals in the west district	104
Figure 16: Travel time to trauma centre	107
Figure 17: Travel time to nearest hospital	108
Figure 18: Index and proportion of crashes accessing trauma care and the nearest hospital	109
Figure 19: Coordinated information flow mechanism between control rooms	119
Figure 20: Calls serviced by CATS ambulance.....	123
Figure 21: Calls serviced by each type of ambulance.....	123
Figure 22: Calls to the police control room	128

Figure 23: Accident calls to the police control room.....	128
Figure 24: Temporal availability of taxis.....	131
Figure 25: Spatial arrangement of ambulances.....	131
Figure 26: PCR van locations in Delhi	132
Figure 27: District wise number of PCR vans in Delhi	132
Figure 28: Chapter five methodology	133
Figure 29: Algorithm to simulate and benchmark existing formal-informal prehospital transportation for road traffic crash	144
Figure 30: AIC and BIC curve for optimum number of components.....	146
Figure 31: Trained GMM clusters based on the police log	146
Figure 32: Ambulance pre-travel time (based on CATS records)	147
Figure 33: Police pre-travel time (based on PCR records)	147
Figure 34: Algorithm1- Splitting aggregated files into a usable trajectory	149
Figure 35: Algorithm 2- stay point detection.....	151
Figure 36: Temporal frequency plot of all stay points.....	152
Figure 37: Timewise availability of taxi stay points.....	154
Figure 38: Taxi stay points for 2 a.m. to 10 a.m.....	155
Figure 39: Taxi stay points for 10 a.m. to 2 p.m.....	156
Figure 40: Taxi stay points for 2 p.m.to 6 p.m.	156
Figure 41: Taxi stay points for 6 p.m. to 1 a.m.....	157
Figure 42: Frequency of calls destined to trauma centre vs. other hospitals	158
Figure 43: Simulation-benchmarking algorithm results	163
Figure 44: Response time distributions of all scenarios	165

Figure 45: Cumulative response time distribution of all scenarios.....	166
Figure 46: Response time distribution of all scenarios.....	167
Figure 47: Total time distribution of all scenarios.....	167
Figure 48: Response time coverage of all scenarios.....	168
Figure 49: Simulation-optimization methodology.....	179
Figure 50: Coverage and Response time for optimum configuration, A = Ambulance, T = Taxis	180

List of Equations

Equation 1: Sample size estimation	74
Equation 2: Logistic Regression- Private Hospital	83
Equation 3: Logistic Regression- Trauma Centre	83
Equation 4: Dissimilarity index	105
Equation 5: Probability of observed data belonging to the k^{th} gaussian	142
Equation 6: Probability distribution of the gaussian mixture model	142

Glossary of Terminology

Term	Definition
Abbreviated Injury Scale (AIS); Injury Severity Score (ISS); Revised trauma score (RTS)	<p>The abbreviated Injury Scale (AIS) describes the anatomical injury severity using consensus-based scores determined by experts.</p> <p>The Revised Trauma Score (RTS) is based on physiological parameters independent of injury diagnoses.</p> <p>The Injury Severity Score (ISS) consists of the square of the highest AIS scores in the three most severely injured body regions (Nakahara and Yokota., 2011).</p>
Advanced prehospital care	<p>The third-tier care interventions include the establishment of complex regional call management centres and highly integrated communications networks, as well as the provision of advanced invasive techniques. On a system level, advanced prehospital interventions include call management centres, the development of integrated wireless communication networks, and the purchase and maintenance of a fleet of sophisticated ground ambulances or air ambulances. Broadly termed “advanced life support,” clinical services like these generally require the skills of a professional prehospital care provider – either a physician or a non-physician paramedic with hundreds, or even thousands, of hours of training (World Health Organization, 2005).</p>
Ambulatory	<p>Ambulatory or outpatient care refers to health services provided to patients who are not confined to an institutional bed as inpatients during the time the services are rendered. Ambulatory care includes medical services of a general (primary) and specialized (secondary) nature (World Health Organization, 2016).</p>
Basic prehospital care	<p>The second tier of care can be provided at the community level by those who have been trained in the principles of basic prehospital trauma care (also known as basic life support). These providers should have extensive formal training in prehospital care, scene management, rescue, stabilization, and the transport of injured people (Oestern, Garg, and Kotwal., 2013).</p>
Emergency Medical Services	<p>Emergency Medical Service (EMS) is a branch of emergency services dedicated to providing out-of-hospital acute medical care and/or transport to definitive care to patients with illnesses and injuries that the patient, or the medical practitioner, believes constitutes a medical emergency (Rishipathak, Yeravdekar, and Rajhans., 2018).</p>

First responder care	These first responders can be taught to recognize an emergency, call for help and provide treatment until formally trained healthcare personnel arrive to give additional care (Rishipathak, Yeravdekar, and Rajhans., 2018).
Health care system	A health system consists of all organizations, people, and actions whose primary intent is to promote, restore or maintain health. This includes efforts to influence determinants of health as well as more direct activities that improve health (World Health Organization, 2007).
Medico-Legal Certificate	Any case of injury or ailment where the attending doctor, after history taking and clinical examination, considers that investigations by law enforcement agencies (and superior military authorities) are warranted to ascertain circumstances and fix responsibility regarding the said injury or ailment according to the "law" (World Health Organization, 2007).
Primary level /District / Rural/ Community/ General hospital	Primary-level hospital: few specialties—mainly internal medicine, obstetrics and gynaecology, paediatrics, and general surgery, or just general practice; limited laboratory services available for general but not specialized pathological analysis (Debas et al., 2015).
Secondary/Regional/Provincial /General hospital	Secondary-level hospital: highly differentiated by function with 5 to 10 clinical specialties; size ranges from 200 to 800 beds; often referred to as a provincial hospital (Debas et al., 2015).
Tertiary-level /National/Central/Academic or teaching or university hospital	Tertiary-level hospital: highly specialized staff and technical equipment— for example, cardiology, intensive care unit, and specialized imaging units; clinical services highly differentiated by function; could have teaching activities; size ranges from 300 to 1,500 beds (Debas et al., 2015).
Trauma Centre (or Trauma Centre or Trauma care)	A trauma center (or trauma centre) is a hospital equipped and staffed to provide care for patients suffering from major traumatic injuries such as falls, motor vehicle collisions, or gunshot wounds. A trauma center may also refer to an emergency department (also known as a "casualty department" or "accident & emergency") without the presence of specialized services to care for victims of major trauma (Sasser et al., 2009).

List of Abbreviations/Acronyms

AIC	Akaike Information Criterion
AIS	Abbreviated Injury Score
API	Application Programming Interface
Auto	Three- wheeler taxi/ three wheeled vehicle/ Auto-rickshaw
BIC	Bayesian Information Criterion
BPL	Below Poverty Line
CATS	Centralized Accident and Trauma Services
EMS	Emergency Medical Services (Ambulance)
ERS	Emergency Response Services (Ambulance, Police)
FIR	First Information Reports
GMM	Gaussian Mixture Model
GS	Good Samaritan
ICU	Intensive Care Units
IoT	Internet of Things
ISS	Injury Severity Score
LAMA	Leave Against Medical Advice
LMIC	Low- and Middle-Income Countries
MP	Medical Personnel
MACT	Motor Accident Claims Tribunal
MHRD	Ministry of Human Resource Development
MLC	Medico-Legal Certificate
MP	Medical Personnel
MRD	Medical Record Department
NERS	Nationwide Emergency Response System
NH	Nearest Hospital
NIH	National Institutes of Health
O-D	Origin - Destination
OS	Other Stakeholder
PCR	Police Control Room
PP	Police Personnel
PSAP	Public Safety Answering Point
RTO	Regional Transport Office or Road Transport Office
SC	Supreme Court
TC	Trauma Centre
TD	Taxi Driver
VRU	Vulnerable Road Users
WHO	World Health Organization