

**PERCEPTIONS OF POLICE PERFORMANCE AND
LEGITIMACY AS DETERMINANTS OF ATTITUDES
TOWARDS VIOLENCE AND COOPERATION WITH
POLICE : STUDY OF YOUTH IN A LEFT - WING
EXTREMIST AFFECTED AREA OF ODISHA, INDIA.**

MANOJ KUMAR CHHABRA



**DEPARTMENT OF HUMANITIES & SOCIAL SCIENCES
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI
MAY 2019**

©Indian Institute of Technology Delhi (IITD), New Delhi, 2019

**Perceptions of Police Performance and Legitimacy as
Determinants of Attitudes Towards Violence and
Cooperation with Police : Study of Youth in a Left-Wing
Extremist Affected area of Odisha, India**

by

MANOJ KUMAR CHHABRA

Department of Humanities & Social Sciences

Submitted

in fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

to the



**Indian Institute of Technology Delhi
May 2019**

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the thesis titled “**Perceptions of Police Performance and Legitimacy as determinants of Attitudes towards Violence and Cooperation with Police: Study of Youth in a Left-Wing Extremist affected area of Odisha, India**”, being submitted by **Mr. Manoj Kumar Chhabra** for the award of **Doctor of Philosophy in Department of Humanities and Social Science**, is a record of original bona-fide research carried out by him under our guidance and supervision at the Department of Humanities and Social Science, Indian Institute of Technology Delhi. In our opinion, the thesis has reached the standards fulfilling the requirements for submission relating to the degree.

The results contained in this thesis have not been submitted elsewhere, either in part or in full, for the award of any other degree or diploma.

Purnima Singh

Professor

Department of Humanities and Social Science

Indian Institute of Technology Delhi

New Delhi, India 110016

Kanika T. Bhal

Professor

Department of Management Studies

Indian Institute of Technology Delhi

New Delhi, India 110016

Date:

New Delhi

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Doing research is a strenuous effort and undertaking a PhD level study requires total devotion over a long period. Trying to do this while simultaneously carrying out equally demanding professional commitments as a police officer is nothing short of a miracle. Last seven years have been a constant reminder of the sheer magnitude of the Herculean task being attempted. If at last the miracle has been achieved it is due to the constant support and encouragement of people who deserve my thanks and gratitude.

First and foremost, I thank my supervisors **Prof. Purnima Singh** and **Prof. Kanika T.Bhal** who have guided me every step of the way and gone the extra mile whenever required. Without their mentoring and unstinting encouragement this would not have been possible. I'm truly indebted to both of them. I'm thankful to the members of my SRC and faculty of the HUSS department for their frequent advice and critique to make the thesis better. I'm grateful to my fellow PhD scholars at IIT who helped me at different times as I was an outstation scholar.

The one person who has stood by me through all this effort has been my wife, Dr. Bindu Chhabra. She has been the anchor who steadied the ship during many turbulent times when I was ready to give up. She was the collaborator, sounding board, motivator, critic and above all the constant companion without whom the journey wouldn't have even started. My daughter Somya and son Arhat have both been highly supportive and encouraged me in their own inimitable way. My friend Manas Dash is deserving of a special thanks for his support.

I'm thankful to DG Police Odisha and my colleagues in the police for their encouragement and support. I'm grateful to Prof. Sandip Anand and Md. Washeem for their professional and technical advice with regard to data analysis. My thanks are due

to Mr. P. C.Tripathy, Mr. P.K.Parichha and Mr. Birendra Pradhan who have helped with formatting and lay out of the thesis.

Manoj Kumar Chhabra

ABSTRACT

Extremist violence is increasing the world over and in India the biggest challenge comes from the Left-Wing Extremism (LWE) or Naxalism affecting central and eastern parts of the country largely inhabited by tribal population. Due to chronic poverty, underdevelopment, inaccessible terrain and failure of governance in these areas, naxal ideology has attracted local youth towards violence, thereby challenging the legitimacy of state. The severity of violence is such that over 8000 civilians and 2000 security personnel have been killed in this war of attrition over last 15 years. Police is the most visible agency of the state fighting this battle and is the primary target of naxal violence.

It is now generally accepted that police cannot perform effectively without the support and cooperation of the local community. Due to its colonial legacy, Indian police does not enjoy a good image and is widely perceived to be insensitive, unfair and corrupt. This seriously erodes its legitimacy and ability to secure public support especially in an area where sections of local population have been radicalised. In order to effectively face the LWE challenge, police have to ensure that their legitimacy is beyond question and the citizens are satisfied with their performance. Literature survey suggests that legitimacy can be improved by adoption of fair procedures by police which enhances public support and cooperation (Sunshine & Tyler, 2003). Perceptions of higher legitimacy also suppresses tendencies towards violence. This process model of policing has wide acceptance in USA and other developed nations. The validity of process model is however contested in less developed countries and conflict environments where effectiveness of police rather than legitimacy considerations have been found to be more relevant (Tankebe, 2009).

This study aims to understand how perceptions of police performance and legitimacy affect attitudes of youth towards cooperation with police and violence against the police in a conflict zone i.e. LWE affected area. Odisha is one of the poorest states of India and heavily affected by LWE. Malkangiri district of Odisha was selected as most suited for the study as it has the highest incidence of naxal violence. It has inaccessible terrain, high tribal population and extremely poor socio-economic development indices. The sample of youth was administered a questionnaire assessing their views about police legitimacy and performance and their attitudes towards cooperation with police and regarding acceptability of violence to attain political ends. The data was analyzed through multiple regression analyses and the results are then discussed.

The findings show that both legitimacy and police performance have a positive impact on public cooperation and negative impact on violence related attitudes as predicted. Further all the variables of police performance except integrity positively impact legitimacy as predicted. The results regarding the mediating role of legitimacy between police performance and outcome variables are however more nuanced. Of the two dimensions of legitimacy, the trust dimension does not show any significant mediation between police performance and attitudes towards cooperation whereas the obligation dimension does mediate this relationship. In case of other outcome variable i.e. attitudes towards violence, both dimensions are found to be mediating the relationship. It implies that public does not trust the police and cooperation maybe due to obligation or rational choice considerations e.g. fear. Another significant result is that perceptions of integrity have no effect on public views about police. The finding is unusual and contrary to mainstream research. The results indicate a partial validation of the process model while simultaneously setting some boundary conditions. The

study adds to the understanding and operability of process-based policing in a high conflict area in a developing nation. It provides a way forward for the practitioners to improve police image and legitimacy and to fight radicalisation by focussing on demilitarization of police, procedural fairness and professional approach. The conflict setting while providing the study its unique flavour also limits its applicability and opens the way for further research in this domain.

सार

चरमपंथी हिंसा दुनिया भर में बढ़ रही है और भारत में सबसे बड़ी चुनौती वामपंथी चरमपंथ (LWE) या नक्सलवाद से आती है, जो देश के मध्य और पूर्वी हिस्सों को प्रभावित करती है, जो मुख्यतः आदिवासी आबादी द्वारा बसा हुआ है। पुरानी गरीबी, अविकसितता, दुर्गम इलाके और इन क्षेत्रों में शासन की विफलता के कारण, नक्सल विचारधारा ने स्थानीय युवाओं को हिंसा की ओर आकर्षित किया है, जिससे राज्य की वैधता को चुनौती मिली है। हिंसा की गंभीरता ऐसी है कि 8000 से अधिक राजनेता और 2000 सुरक्षाकर्मी मारे गए हैं पिछले 15 वर्षों में आकर्षण के इस युद्ध में। पुलिस इस लड़ाई को लड़ने वाली राज्य की सबसे अधिक दिखाई देने वाली एजेंसी है और नक्सल हिंसा का प्राथमिक लक्ष्य है।

अब यह आमतौर पर स्वीकार किया जाता है कि पुलिस स्थानीय समुदाय के समर्थन और सहयोग के बिना प्रभावी ढंग से प्रदर्शन नहीं कर सकती है। अपनी औपनिवेशिक विरासत के कारण, भारतीय पुलिस एक अच्छी छवि का आनंद नहीं लेती है और व्यापक रूप से असंवेदनशील, अनुचित और भ्रष्ट माना जाता है। यह गंभीरता से अपनी वैधता और सार्वजनिक समर्थन को सुरक्षित करने की क्षमता को खासतौर पर एक ऐसे क्षेत्र में मिटा देता है जहां स्थानीय आबादी के वर्गों को कट्टरपंथी बना दिया गया है। प्रभावी रूप से एलडब्ल्यूई चुनौती का सामना करने के लिए, पुलिस को यह सुनिश्चित करना होगा कि उनकी वैधता सवाल से परे है और नागरिक उनके प्रदर्शन से संतुष्ट हैं। साहित्य सर्वेक्षण बताता है कि पुलिस द्वारा निष्पक्ष प्रक्रियाओं को अपनाने से वैधता में सुधार किया जा सकता है जो सार्वजनिक समर्थन और सहयोग को बढ़ाता है (सनशाइन एंड टायलर, 2003) उच्च वैधता की धारणाएं भी हिंसा की ओर प्रवृत्ति को दबाती हैं। पुलिसिंग की प्रक्रिया मॉडल की यूएसए और अन्य विकसित राष्ट्रों में व्यापक स्वीकृति है। हालांकि

प्रक्रिया मॉडल की वैधता कम विकसित देशों और संघर्ष के वातावरण में लड़ी जाती है, जहां वैधता संबंधी विचारों के बजाय पुलिस की प्रभावशीलता अधिक प्रासंगिक पाई गई है (टैंकबे, 2009)

इस अध्ययन का उद्देश्य यह समझना है कि पुलिस के प्रदर्शन और वैधता की धारणाएं पुलिस के साथ सहयोग के प्रति युवाओं के दृष्टिकोण को कैसे प्रभावित करती हैं और पुलिस के खिलाफ एक संघर्ष क्षेत्र यानी एलडब्ल्यूई प्रभावित क्षेत्र में हिंसा करती हैं। ओडिशा भारत के सबसे गरीब राज्यों में से एक है और LWE से काफी प्रभावित है। ओडिशा के मलकानगिरी जिले को अध्ययन के लिए सबसे उपयुक्त चुना गया क्योंकि इसमें सबसे ज्यादा नक्सली हिंसा होती है। इसमें दुर्गम इलाका, उच्च जनजातीय आबादी और बेहद गरीब सामाजिक-आर्थिक विकास सूचकांक हैं। युवाओं के नमूने को पुलिस की वैधता और प्रदर्शन के बारे में उनके विचारों और पुलिस के साथ सहयोग के प्रति उनके दृष्टिकोण और राजनीतिक छोर को प्राप्त करने के लिए हिंसा की स्वीकार्यता के बारे में उनके दृष्टिकोण का आकलन करने के लिए एक प्रश्नावली प्रशासित किया गया था। कई प्रतिगमन विश्लेषणों के माध्यम से डेटा का विश्लेषण किया गया और फिर परिणामों पर चर्चा की गई।

निष्कर्ष बताते हैं कि वैधता और पुलिस प्रदर्शन दोनों का सार्वजनिक सहयोग पर सकारात्मक प्रभाव पड़ता है और भविष्यवाणी के अनुसार हिंसा संबंधी दृष्टिकोण पर नकारात्मक प्रभाव पड़ता है। ईमानदारी के अलावा पुलिस के प्रदर्शन के सभी चर सकारात्मक भविष्यवाणी को वैधता को प्रभावित करते हैं। पुलिस के प्रदर्शन और परिणाम चर के बीच वैधता की मध्यस्थता भूमिका के बारे में परिणाम हालांकि अधिक सूक्ष्म हैं। वैधता के दो आयामों में से, विश्वास आयाम पुलिस के प्रदर्शन और सहयोग के प्रति

दृष्टिकोण के बीच कोई महत्वपूर्ण मध्यस्थता नहीं दिखाता है जबकि दायित्व आयाम इस रिश्ते की मध्यस्थता करता है। अन्य परिणाम चर के मामले में अर्थात् हिंसा के प्रति दृष्टिकोण, दोनों आयामों को रिश्ते की मध्यस्थता करते हुए पाया जाता है। तात्पर्य यह है कि जनता पुलिस या सहयोग पर भरोसा नहीं करती है, शायद दायित्व या तर्कसंगत विकल्प के कारण उदा। डर। एक और महत्वपूर्ण परिणाम यह है कि पुलिस के बारे में जनता के विचारों पर अखंडता की धारणाओं का कोई प्रभाव नहीं पड़ता है। यह खोज असामान्य और मुख्यधारा के अनुसंधान के विपरीत है। परिणाम कुछ सीमा शर्तों को एक साथ सेट करते समय प्रक्रिया मॉडल के आंशिक सत्यापन का संकेत देते हैं। अध्ययन विकासशील राष्ट्र में उच्च संघर्ष वाले क्षेत्र में प्रक्रिया-आधारित पुलिसिंग की समझ और संचालन में जोड़ता है। यह चिकित्सकों के लिए पुलिस की छवि और वैधता में सुधार करने और पुलिस के विमुद्रीकरण, प्रक्रियात्मक निष्पक्षता और व्यावसायिकता पर ध्यान केंद्रित करके कट्टरता से लड़ने के लिए एक रास्ता प्रदान करता है। अध्ययन को अद्वितीय स्वाद प्रदान करते हुए संघर्ष की सेटिंग भी इसकी प्रयोज्यता को सीमित करती है और इस डोमेन में आगे के अनुसंधान के लिए रास्ता खोलती है।

Contents

List of Figures	vi
List of Tables	vii
1 Introduction, Background and Context	1
1.1 Understanding the LWE Challenge	2
1.1.1 Genesis	2
1.1.2 Rationale	3
1.1.2.1 Poverty and under development	3
1.1.2.2 Resource Curse	5
1.1.3 Counter Narrative	6
1.1.4 Evolution of LWE in Odisha	8
1.1.5 State Response	10
1.2 Police in India	11
1.2.1 Evolution from Colonial Rule to Democracy	12
1.2.2 Need for Modern Policing	13
1.2.3 LWE Challenges for Odisha Police	15
1.2.3.1 Police Response	16
1.3 Process Based Policing	17
1.4 Relevance & Objectives of the Study	20
1.4.1 The Culture Gap	21
1.4.2 The Theory Gap	22
1.4.3 Objectives for the Study	23

2	Review of Literature	24
2.1	Perceptions of Legitimacy	24
2.1.1	Dimensions of Legitimacy	27
2.1.1.1	Obligation	27
2.1.1.2	Trust	28
2.2	Perceptions of Police Performance	30
2.2.1	Perceptions of Fairness	30
2.2.2	Perceptions of Police Effectiveness	33
2.2.2.1	Measuring Police Effectiveness	34
2.2.3	Perceptions of Police Professionalism	38
2.2.4	Perceptions of Police Integrity	42
2.3	Relation between Variables and Hypotheses Development	44
2.3.1	Legitimacy and Attitude towards Cooperation with Police . . .	44
2.3.2	Legitimacy and Attitude towards Violence	47
2.3.3	Fairness, Legitimacy and Cooperation with Police	50
2.3.4	Fairness, Legitimacy and Attitude towards Violence	55
2.3.5	Effectiveness, Legitimacy and Cooperation with Police	57
2.3.6	Effectiveness, Legitimacy and Attitude towards Violence	62
2.3.7	Police Professionalism, Legitimacy and Cooperation with Police and Attitude towards Violence	65
2.3.8	Integrity, Legitimacy, Cooperation with Police and Attitude towards Violence	67
2.4	Summary	70

3	Methodology and Psychometric Properties of the Constructs	72
3.1	Overall Methodology	72
3.2	Site and Sample for the study	72
3.3	Research Instruments	74
3.3.1	Fairness	75
3.3.2	Police Effectiveness	75
3.3.3	Police Professionalism	76
3.3.4	Police Integrity	76
3.3.5	Legitimacy	76
3.3.6	Cooperation with Police	77
3.3.7	Attitude towards Violence	77
3.3.8	Control Variables	77
3.4	Procedure	79
3.4.1	Testing the Psychometric Properties of the scale	79
3.4.1.1	Fairness	80
3.4.1.2	Police Effectiveness	82
3.4.1.3	Police Professionalism	85
3.4.1.4	Police Integrity	87
3.4.1.5	Legitimacy	89
3.4.1.6	Cooperation with Police	91
3.4.1.7	Attitude towards the use of Violence	94
3.4.2	Testing for Common Method Bias	97
4	Analysis and Results	99
4.1	Descriptives and Inter correlations	99

4.2	Analytical Techniques for Hypothesis Testing	100
4.3	Hypothesis Testing	101
4.4	Summary of the Results	145
5	Discussion and Conclusions	151
5.1	Study Context	151
5.1.1	The LWE Context	151
5.1.2	The Cultural Context	153
5.2	Key Results and Discussion	154
5.2.1	Legitimacy as Fulcrum	155
5.2.1.1	Attitude towards Cooperation with Police	156
5.2.1.2	Legitimacy and Attitudes towards Violence	157
5.2.1.3	Legitimacy as a function of Police Fairness	158
5.2.1.4	Legitimacy as a function of Police Effectiveness	159
5.2.1.5	Legitimacy as a function of Police Professionalism	161
5.2.2	Role of Police Performance	163
5.2.2.1	Perceptions of Fairness in relation to Attitudes Towards Cooperation and Violence	163
5.2.2.2	Perceptions of Police Effectiveness in relation to Attitudes Towards Cooperation and Violence	165
5.2.2.3	Perceptions of Police Professionalism in relation to Attitudes Towards Cooperation and Violence	168
5.2.3	The curious case of Police Integrity	169
5.2.4	Legitimacy as a Mediating Factor	172
5.3	Implications for Research and Practice	175
5.3.1	Theoretical Implications	176

5.3.1.1	Legitimacy as Framework	176
5.3.1.2	Fairness vs Effectiveness	177
5.3.1.3	Legitimacy and Violence	178
5.3.1.4	The LWE Context	178
5.3.1.5	Process based Model of Policing	179
5.3.2	Implications for Practitioners	179
5.3.2.1	Demilitarization of the Police	180
5.3.2.2	The Challenge of Radicalisation	181
5.3.2.3	The Integrity Conundrum	182
5.3.2.4	Professional and Norm based Policing	183
5.4	Limitations and Directions for future Research	184
5.5	Conclusion – Final thoughts	187
	References	190
	Appendix A Questionnaire	220
	Appendix B List of Abbreviations	228
	Appendix C Map – India Naxal Affected Areas	230
	Appendix D Map – Odisha Naxal Affected Areas	231
	Appendix E Map – Malkangiri District	232
	Appendix F Brief Profile	233

List of Figures

2.1	Proposed Model	71
3.1	CFA Model for Fairness	80
3.2	Revised CFA Model for Fairness	81
3.3	CFA Model for Police Effectiveness	83
3.4	Revised CFA Model for Police Effectiveness	83
3.5	CFA Model for Police Professionalism	85
3.6	Revised CFA Model for Police Professionalism	86
3.7	CFA Model for Police Integrity	87
3.8	CFA Model for Legitimacy	89
3.9	Revised CFA Model for Legitimacy	90
3.10	CFA Model for Cooperation with Police	92
3.11	Revised CFA Model for Cooperation with Police	93
3.12	CFA Model for Attitude towards Violence	95
3.13	Revised CFA Model for Attitude towards Violence	95

List of Tables

3.1	Demographic Information	73
3.2	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Fairness	81
3.3	Factor Loadings of different items for Fairness	82
3.4	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Police Effectiveness.	84
3.5	Factor Loadings of different items for Police Effectiveness	84
3.6	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Police Professionalism	86
3.7	Factor Loadings of different items for Police Professionalism	87
3.8	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Integrity	88
3.9	Factor Loadings of different items for Police Integrity	88
3.10	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Legitimacy	90
3.11	Factor Loadings of different items for Legitimacy	91
3.12	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Cooperation with Police	93
3.13	Factor Loadings of different items for Cooperation with Police	94
3.14	Fit Statistics of the Confirmatory Factor Analysis for Attitude towards Violence	96
3.15	Factor Loadings of different items for Attitude towards Violence	96
3.16	Composite Reliability, Average Variance Extracted and Cronbach α for various Constructs	98
4.1	Descriptive Statistics and Intercorrelations	100
4.2	Multiple Regression Results (Trust and Obligation as Predictors)	102
4.3	Multiple Regression Results (Decision Making and Quality of Treatment as Predictors)	104
4.4	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Decision Making and Cooperation with Police	106

4.5	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in relationship between Decision Making and Cooperation with Police	108
4.6	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Quality of Treatment and Cooperation with Police	110
4.7	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in relationship between Quality of Treatment and Cooperation with Police	112
4.8	Multiple Regression Results for Attitude towards Violence (Decision Making and Quality of Treatment as Predictors)	114
4.9	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Decision Making and Attitude towards Violence	116
4.10	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in relationship between Decision Making and Attitude towards Violence	118
4.11	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Quality of Treatment and Attitude towards Violence	120
4.12	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in relationship between Quality of Treatment and Attitude towards Violence	122
4.13	Multiple Regression Results (Police Effectiveness as Predictor)	124
4.14	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Police Effectiveness and Cooperation with Police	126
4.15	Regression Results for Mediating effect of Obligation in relationship between Police Effectiveness and Cooperation with Police	128
4.16	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Police Effectiveness and Attitude towards Violence	130
4.17	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in relationship between Police Effectiveness and Attitude towards Violence	132
4.18	Multiple Regression Results (Police Professionalism as Predictor)	134
4.19	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in relationship between Police Professionalism and Cooperation with Police	136
4.20	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in relationship between Police Professionalism and Cooperation with Police	138

4.21	Regression Results for Mediating role of Trust in the relationship between Police Professionalism and Attitude towards Violence	140
4.22	Regression Results for Mediating role of Obligation in the relationship between Police Professionalism and Attitude towards Violence	142
4.23	Multiple Regression Results (Integrity as Predictor)	144
4.24	Summary of Results	145