

**SELECT DIMENSIONS OF ORGANIZATIONAL  
EFFECTIVENESS IN POLICING SYSTEMS –  
A DIAGNOSTIC ANALYSIS**

**By**

**SHAMSHER SINGH**

**Department of Management Studies**

Submitted

in fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of

**DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY**

**to the**



**Indian Institute of Technology Delhi**

**July, 2011**

## **Certificate**

This is to certify that the thesis entitled “**Select Dimensions of Organizational Effectiveness in Policing Systems – A Diagnostic Analysis**” being submitted by **Shamsher Singh** to the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi for the award of degree of ‘Doctor of Philosophy’ is a record of bonafide research work carried by him. He has worked under my guidance and supervision, and has fulfilled the requirements for the submission of this thesis. To the best of my knowledge the results contained in this thesis have not been submitted in part or full to any other University or Institute for award of any degree or Diploma.

Prof. Vinayshil Gautam,  
A Al\_Sager Chair Emeritus Professor  
Department of Management Studies  
Indian Institute of Technology,  
New Delhi-110016

## **Acknowledgements**

It is a pleasure to thank the many people who made this thesis possible. It is difficult to state my gratitude in words to my Ph.D. supervisor, Prof. Vinyshil Gautam, He made entire research work period a very enriching experience with his inspiring thoughts, motivating ideas and his great efforts to explain things clearly and simply. Throughout my thesis-writing period, he provided encouragement, sound advice, good teaching, and lots of brilliant and innovative ideas. His simple and straightforward attitude made the things easier and simpler for me especially in research work and saved me from unnecessary digression.

I wish to place on record my gratitude to the thoughts of Gandhiji (Shri M. K. Gandhi) on truth and his search for truth. His thoughts as reflected in the book “The story of My Experiments with Truth” and his commentary on Gita have deeply impacted my thinking and completely changed my outlook towards research as a truth finding mission.

I would like to thank many professors like Prof. (Dr.) Kanika T. Bhal, Prof. (Dr.) P. K. Jain, Dr. Seema Sharma who have taught me management at IIT Delhi.

I am indebted to my many student colleagues especially Miss Tuhina Mukherjee for helping me in statistical analysis and making the research work an enjoyable journey. I am thankful to librarian and other staff of IIT Delhi for their continuous support in my research work. I offer my regards to all of those who supported me in any respect during the completion of the project.

I am grateful to my wife, Madhu, who helped me in proof reading and gracefully tolerated my preoccupation with the research work. My sons, Aditya and Aryaman, helped me in sharpening the queries. My Daughter, Mehak, supported me in this grueling endeavor in her innovative ways.

Lastly, and most importantly, I wish to thank my Mother, she bore me, raised me, taught me to look for truth, and loved me. To her I dedicate this thesis.

Shamsher Singh

IIT Delhi, New Delhi

## **Abstract**

Police system is an instrument to strengthen the articulation and implementation of what the society defines for itself its norms, its rules and regulations. Police forces are basically hierarchical and bureaucratic organizations controlled by the Government in power on behalf of the society. Main functions of police are prevention of crime and disorder. Police is the key instrument of the state to implement the rule of law and therefore its effectiveness is very important for the protection of rights of the citizens. Public perceptions of police effectiveness matter because it affects the legitimacy of the state.

Organizational effectiveness in the service oriented organizations has been studied widely but effectiveness in police organizations is relatively a new concept. Review of literature and various reports of the different police commissions and the National Police Commission (1980) on the workings of the police organizations yielded the area of research for the present study. Literature on the conceptual framework of organizational effectiveness was reviewed and Competing Value and Multiple Constituencies frameworks were selected to analyze the issues of effectiveness for the police organizations. Police effectiveness to a large extent is matter of what people think of police services and therefore any discussion on police effectiveness requires public opinion dimension. In India the image of police forces has never been very good and there is always a disconnect between what police is doing and what public expect. The present study analyses the expectations and perceptions of select key stakeholders regarding the effectiveness of the police organizations. The efficacy of the police organizations for good governance was

analyzed by applying the frameworks of organizational effectiveness to the Rural and Urban police organizations. The criteria used by the different stakeholders for assessing the effectiveness of police organizations (Rural and Urban) in India were identified. Various stakeholders were identified like -. Unskilled Labourers, Petty Traders/ Shop Owners, Small Business Owners, Large Business Owners, Senior Executives, Junior Executive/ Sales persons, Political Leaders, Farm Owners, Farm Labourers and Public Figures . Interviews of the stakeholders from the urban and rural areas were recorded for capturing the relative importance of the criteria used for evaluating the effectiveness of the police organizations. Criteria/parameters used for the evaluation of the effectiveness of police organizations were identified as Polite behavior, Compassion, Fairness in behavior, Willingness to help, Respect for others, Subtle/ diplomatic, To be in continuous and constant touch with common man, Promptness , Efficiency, Honesty and integrity , Effective action, Maintenance of safety and security, Good management of organizational tasks etc . Stakeholders' relative powers in influencing the priorities of the police organizations were analyzed and assessed.

Diagnostic analysis of effectiveness of police organizations was done by analyzing the performance indicators (crime rate, investigation rate, chargesheet rate and conviction rate.) used by police. Crime rate was not found to be a suitable and valid indicator of performance. One of the conclusions that seemed to emerge from the study of secondary data was that performance of police has deteriorated under investigation rate and conviction rate but has significantly improved under chargesheet rate and detection rate. The analysis revealed that these performance indicators are not sufficient to measure the police effectiveness and there is urgent

need to devise the more relevant and suitable performance indicators to measure the performance of the police.

Responses of the select stakeholders were analyzed using the statistical methods like mean analysis, factor analysis, t-test, ANOVA etc. Comparative analysis of expectations and perceptions of the respondents from rural and urban areas, different socio-economic backgrounds, different educational standards and various age groups was done. Significant differences were found amongst the expectations and perceptions of various stakeholders under the police behavior related parameters. Surprisingly, in the survey, majority of the respondents indicated that the effective implementation of moral and ethical laws is the single most important factor to judge the effectiveness of the police organization. Whereas it is one of the least important factors in the priorities of the police organizations. The management of the organizational task is one of the high priorities of the police organizations. But for the majority of the respondents, this parameter was on fourth and fifth place in importance for effectiveness. The interaction with police resulted in significant negative changes in the stakeholders' perception of effectiveness of the police. It shows that the interaction process was not positive and there is serious need to look into behavioral and attitudinal aspects of the police personnel.

It can be inferred from the analysis that broadly the priorities and goals of the police organizations matched the expectations of political executives, rich and business class and senior executives. Implication of the study is that future plans for successful reforms in the police should give due importance to the expectations and perceptions of various stakeholders. The reasons for the negative effects of the interaction with police need to be examined and addressed immediately.

# CONTENTS

	<b>PAGE NO</b>
CERTIFICATE	i
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii-iii
ABSTRACT	iv-vi
CONTENTS	vii-ix
LIST OF FIGURES	x-xi
LIST OF TABLES	xii-xiii
ANNEXURES	xiv
ABBREVIATIONS	xv
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction</b>	<b>1-53</b>
1.1 Importance of Police Organization to the Society	1
1.2 Evolution of Indian Police	3
1.3 Police in Modern India	6
1.4 Police in Colonial Rule	6
1.5 Organizational Structure of Police.	9
1.6 Trends in Police Effectiveness in other Democratic Countries of World	10
1.7 U K Police	16
1.8 Evolution of American Police System	20
1.9 Review of Working of Police in India	29
1.10 Indian Police Commission 1902	32
1.11 State Police Commissions	33
1.12 Study on Image of Police in India	35
1.13 The National Police Commission (NPC)	36
1.14 Other Committees on Police Reforms	46
1.15 Response to Recommendations of NPC and Other Committees and Commissions	48
1.16 Conclusion	53
<b>Chapter 2. Review of literature</b>	<b>54-110</b>
2.1 Organization	54
2.2 Historical Developments in Organizational Effectiveness (OE)	56
2.3 Goal Approach Research	57
2.4 Evaluative Measures	60
2.5 Problems in OE Research	63
2.6 Competing Value Framework and Multiple Constituencies as Alternative Approaches	65
2.7 Multiple-Constituency (MC) Approach	70
2.8 Police Organizations	74
2.9 Review of Reports on Working of Indian Police Organization	76
2.10 Successive stages of Organizational Effectiveness studies in Police Organizations	84

2.11 Organizational Effectiveness of Police in Democracies	87
2.12 Legitimacy, Procedural Justice and Police Effectiveness	91
2.13 Good Governance, Democracy and Police Effectiveness	95
2.14 Important Studies of Organizational Effectiveness in Police Organizations	98
<b>Chapter 3. Research Objectives and Methodology</b>	<b>107-139</b>
3.1 Introduction	107
3.2 Research Objectives	109
3.3 Research Hypotheses	110
3.4 Research Methodology	110
3.5 Conceptual Framework and Research Model	113
3.6 Research Design	117
3.7 Pilot Study	118
3.8 Survey & Data Collection	119
3.9 Framing of questionnaire	120
3.10 Demographic Distribution of Stakeholders	121
3.11 Police and Good Governance	125
3.12 Organizational Performance Indicators	129
3.13 Criteria of Effectiveness	131
3.14 Study Process	137
3.15 Statistical Methods used for Analysis	138
<b>Chapters 4 Indian Police – Diagnostic Analysis of Effectiveness</b>	<b>140-164</b>
4.1 Criminal Justice System and Indian Police	141
4.2 Criminal Justice System	142
4.3 The Process of Criminal Justice and Criminal Justice System	143
4.4 Organizational Goals of the Police	144
4.5 Organizational Effectiveness of Indian Police-- Performance Indicators	146
4.6 Investigation Rate	151
4.7 Chargesheet Rate	152
4.8 Conviction Rate	153
4.9 Disposal and Pendency in the Courts --Justice Delayed is Justice Denied	156
4.10 Analysis of the Performance Indicators	157
4.11 Concluding Remarks	163
<b>Chapter 5. Discussion &amp; Analysis of the Survey Results</b>	<b>165-201</b>
5.1 Expectations of Effectiveness from Police	165
5.2 Data Analysis	167
5.3 Factor Analysis: Expectations	168
5.4 Mean Analysis- Expectations	170
5.5 Rural and Urban	174
5.6 Socioeconomic Status	176
5.7 Education	182
5.8 Age	184
5.9 Effect of interaction with Police	186

5.10 ANOVA analysis	188
5.11 Conclusion	200
<b>Chapter 6. Perception and Ground Realities</b>	<b>203-240</b>
6.1 Perceptions of Police Effectiveness	203
6.2 Factor Analysis : Perceptions	203
6.3 Comparative Mean Analysis- Perceptions and Expectations	207
6.4 Rural and Urban	210
6.5 Socioeconomic Status	211
6.6 Age	215
6.7 Education	216
6.8 Effect of interaction with Police.	219
6.9 ANOVA analysis of Perception of Stakeholders	222
6.10 Conclusion	240
<b>Chapter 7. Conclusion and Implications</b>	<b>243-260</b>
7.1 Conclusions from secondary data	243
7.2 Conclusions from primary data	248
7.3 Implications	252
7.4 Limitations of the study	260
7.5 Future directions for further research	260
<b>References</b>	<b>261-296</b>
<b>Appendix</b>	<b>297-305</b>
Questionnaire English	
Questionnaire Gujarati	
<b>Biodata</b>	<b>306-307</b>