

A FRAMEWORK FOR VALUES EDUCATION IN SCHOOLS

MANISH KUMAR SRIVASTAVA



**DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT STUDIES
INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI**

JUNE 2021

A Framework for Values Education in Schools

by

Manish Kumar Srivastava

Department of Management Studies

Submitted

in fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

to the



Indian Institute of Technology Delhi

June 2021

Certificate

This is to certify that the thesis entitled “**A Framework for Values Education in School**” being submitted by Mr. **Manish Kumar Srivastava** to the Indian Institute of Technology, Delhi for the award of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy is a bonafide record of the research work carried out by him under my supervision and guidance. The thesis work, in my opinion, has reached the requisite standard, fulfilling the requirements of the said degree. The results contained in the thesis have not been submitted, in part or full, to any other University or Institute for the award of any degree or diploma.

Dr. Harish Chaudhry
Associate Professor
Department of Management Studies
Indian Institute of Technology Delhi
New Delhi – 110016
India

Acknowledgment

First of all, I would like to thank my supervisor **Dr. Harish Chaudhry** for allowing me to work under his supervision. I am highly indebted to Dr. Chaudhry, who gave enough freedom to explore new things and cautioned me whenever I used to get distracted to other paths and always motivated me in my downtimes. Dr. Chaudhry not only sustained my academic interest but also provided all kinds of encouragement, support, and cooperation for the collection, compilation, and analysis of data along with the critical appreciation of pertinent literature related to the topic of research.

I am also thankful to Prof. Jitendra Madaan, Prof. Shuchi Sinha and Prof. V. M. Chariar, my student review committee (SRC) members, for their invaluable suggestions and critiques that helped me in reframing my research questions and presenting my work in a more decent format and helped me to improve upon my understanding of research methodology. I acknowledge Prof. Ashish Pandey (IITB) for his kind review of the work associated with my thesis. I sincerely thank my friend and elder brother, Prof. Ram Komal Prasad (ICCMRT, Lucknow), who put all efforts helping me in the data analysis part and overall guidance.

I am sincerely indebted to my senior research fellows from IITD, Dr Anurag Singh Chauhan, and Ms Sikha Sota and, my co-researcher Ms Anshika Singh Tanwar for their valuable inputs and suggestions for research methodology, and colleague Ms Sapna Bharadwaj for other technical support. I place special regard to my batch mate and a kind-hearted friend Dr Nitin Raja Singh (IITD) as he helped me in concept development and also motivated me to produce my best during my research journey. I thank them and wish them all success in life.

I dedicate this entire work to my mother Smt. Veena Srivastava and father Sri Raghunath Ji Srivastava because of their wishes, prayers and financial support I could fulfill my dreams. My mother has been the backbone of whatever I have achieved in life. My growing age, family responsibility, old parents and, financial constraints may have interrupted in the educational journey, but my wife Smt. Suchitra Srivastava and my two sons, Aarush and Aahan managed it carefully and patiently, so they are also part of the credit. My wife has been a pillar of strength to me during my research journey. My sisters and their family have been very supportive to me during the study. My teachers, friends, and colleagues, whoever motivated me, are part of the credit.

Finally, I bow my head to Almighty God, as I believe whatever is in destiny, none can stop to have. This faith always put me forward to accomplish all my difficult task of life.

Manish Kumar Srivastava

Abstract

The study was a rejoinder to the continuous and increasing need for values education in schools that has been propagated by not only United Nations Organization (Seventeen Sustainable Development Goals - The United Nations, 2015) and UNESCO (2002) but also by different education policies of India (National Curriculum Framework, NCERT, 2005; S.B.Chavan Committee Report, 1999; National Policy on Education, 1986; Kothari Commission, 1964-66). The study identified the gaps from the review of literature on values education framework, and made an attempt to prepare a framework model consisting of the following:

- A list of the most preferred values to be taught in schools.
- Specific methods to teach different values.
- Teachers' perception of values education and its delivery in classrooms.
- Factors impacting values education and their inter-relationship.

This study adopted a mixed research method, i.e., qualitative and quantitative. A regression model was determined, which showed the strengths of the relationship between values education factors and perceived effectiveness of values education. The results were verified by TISM hierarchical model. The values education factors, as identified by exploratory factor analysis, were family cohesion, parents' conflict, parents' expectations, school administration, teachers' role, mass media and internet, public institution, community structure, social orientation, and religious education. School administration, teachers' roles, and public institutions are found the most significant factors impacting values education. Forgiveness, trustworthiness, and democratic values are to be included in the list of most preferred values to be taught, and meditation emerged as one of the most preferred methods to teach values. This study has

provided pedagogical approaches for teaching values that are useful not only for teachers but also, it may become part of the teacher training program specially created for values education. The findings of the study may be utilized by schools and education policymakers in planning, structuring, and strengthening the process of values education.

सार

यह अध्ययन स्कूलों में मूल्यों की शिक्षा के लिए निरंतर और बढ़ती आवश्यकता के लिए महत्वपूर्ण है, जिसे न केवल संयुक्त राष्ट्र संगठन (संयुक्त राष्ट्र, 2015 के सतत विकास लक्ष्यों) और यूनेस्को (2002) द्वारा प्रचारित किया गया है, बल्कि भारत की विभिन्न शिक्षा नीतियों द्वारा भी (NCFSE-NCERT, 2005; SBChavan Committee Report-1999; NPE- 1986; कोठारीआयोग, 1964-66) प्रचारित किया गया है। इस अध्ययन ने मूल्यों की शिक्षा के ढांचे पर साहित्य की समीक्षा से अंतराल की पहचान की, और एक रूपरेखा मॉडल तैयार करने का प्रयास किया जिसमें निम्नलिखित शामिल हैं:

- स्कूलों में पढ़ाने के लिए सबसे पसंदीदा मूल्यों की एक सूची।
- विभिन्न मूल्यों को सिखाने के लिए विशिष्ट तरीके।
- कक्षाओं में मूल्यों की शिक्षा और उसके वितरण के बारे में शिक्षकों की धारणा।
- मूल्यों की शिक्षा के कारकों और उनके अंतर-संबंधों को प्रभावित करने वाले कारक।

इस अध्ययन ने मिश्रित अनुसंधान विधि यानी गुणात्मक और मात्रात्मक दोनों को अपनाया। एक प्रतिगमन मॉडल निर्धारित किया गया जिसने मूल्यों की शिक्षा के कारकों और मूल्यों की शिक्षा की प्रभावशीलता के बीच संबंधों को दिखाया। जिसके परिणाम, TISM पदानुक्रमित मॉडल द्वारा सत्यापित किए गए। खोजकारक कारक के रूप में पहचाने जाने वाले मूल्य शिक्षाकारक पारिवारिक सामंजस्य, माता-पिता का संघर्ष, माता-पिता की अपेक्षा, स्कूलप्रशासन, शिक्षकों की भूमिका, जनमीडिया और इंटरनेट, सार्वजनिक संस्थान, सामुदायिक संरचना, सामाजिक अभिविन्यास और धार्मिक शिक्षाथे पाये गए।

स्कूलप्रशासन, शिक्षकों की भूमिका और सार्वजनिक संस्थान मूल्यों की शिक्षा को प्रभावित करने वाले सबसे महत्वपूर्ण कारक पाए गये हैं। इस अध्ययन के अनुसार क्षमा, भरोसेमंदता और लोकतांत्रिक मूल्यों को सिखाया जाने वाले सबसे पसंदीदा मूल्यों की सूची में शामिल किया गया है, और ध्यान, मूल्यों को सिखाने के लिए सबसे पसंदीदा तरीकों में से एक के रूप में पाया गया।

इस अध्ययन ने शिक्षण मूल्यों के लिए शैक्षणिक दृष्टिकोण प्रदान किया है जो न केवल शिक्षकों के लिए उपयोगी हैं, बल्कि यह शिक्षक मूल्यों के लिए विशेष रूप से बनाए गए शिक्षक प्रशिक्षण कार्यक्रम का हिस्सा बन सकते हैं। इस अध्ययन के निष्कर्षों का उपयोग स्कूलों और शिक्षा नीतिनिर्माताओं द्वारा मूल्यों की शिक्षा की प्रक्रिया की योजना, संरचना को और मजबूत बनाने में किया जा सकता है।

Contents

Certificate.....	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Abstract	v
Content	viii
List of figures	xiii
List of Tables	xv
List of abbreviations	xxii
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Background of the study	1
1.2 Values	2
1.3 Values guidelines in the Indian constitution	3
1.4 Values degradation.....	4
1.5 Values edification in Schools.....	5
1.6 Values education Framework for Schools	6
1.7 Need for the Study	6
1.8 Scope and significance of the research	7
1.9 Research questions.....	8
1.10 Research Objectives.....	8
1.11 Overview of Thesis	8
Chapter 2: Review of Literature.....	10
2.1 Values	12
2.2 Theories on Values Development	14
2.3 Values Education	19
2.4 Values degradation in India	21
2.5 Values Education in Schools.....	22
2.6 Concern for values education in Indian education policies.....	23
2.7 Values Education Framework for Schools.....	24
2.7.1 The UNESCO guidelines.....	25

2.7.2 The existing frameworks.....	25
2.8 Factors related to values education	26
2.9 Bibliometric analysis and Classification of research papers on values education	30
2.9.1 Methodology for bibliometric analysis	31
2.9.2 Results and Analysis	32
2.10 Research gaps.....	53
Chapter 3: Research Methodology.....	55
3.1 Research Design.....	55
3.2 Philosophy of research.....	57
3.3 Research Purpose	58
3.4 Sampling procedure	59
3.5 To identify the values to be taught in schools (Research Objective 1)	60
3.6 To identify the methodologies adopted to teach values in schools (Research objective 2).	62
3.7 To identify the perspectives of teachers on values education delivery process in schools (Research Objective 3).....	64
3.8 To identify factors impacting values education and their relationship with the perceived effectiveness of values education in schools (Research Objective 4).....	67
3.9. Design and development of measurement scale:	68
3.10. Exploratory Factor analysis	69
3.11. Determination of Reliability and Validity of the scale	72
3.12 Statistical tools used in the research	73
3.12.1 Correlation analysis	74
3.12.2 Regression analysis.....	74
3.13 To develop a general framework exhibiting the interlinkages that exists between the values education factors contributing to values education (Research Objective 5).	75
3.14 Focus Group Study	76
3.15 Total Interpretive Structural Modeling (TISM).....	77
3.16 Steps of the basic process of TISM development	79
Chapter 4: Data Analysis and Interpretation.....	84
4.1 Values to be taught in schools.....	84
4.1.1 Section 1: Values that are important for children and should be taught in schools:	84

4.1.2 Aggregate of all values which should be taught in schools (AGVSBT top 15).....	87
4.1.3 Section 2: Values that are being taught currently in schools	88
4.1.4 Aggregate of all values which are being taught currently in schools AGCTV (top 15)	91
4.1.5 Analysis of the result	92
4.2 Methodologies adopted to teach values in schools	94
4.2.1 Most preferred methodologies for teaching various values	94
4.2.2 Methodologies for teaching respect	94
4.2.3 Methodologies for teaching honesty	95
4.2.4 Methodologies for teaching trustworthiness	97
4.2.5 Methodologies for teaching peace	98
4.2.6 Methodologies for teaching justice	99
4.2.7 Methodologies for teaching understanding.....	100
4.2.8 Methodologies for teaching tolerance.....	101
4.2.9 Methodologies for teaching love.....	102
4.2.10 Methodologies for teaching care.....	103
4.2.11 Methodologies for teaching compassion.....	104
4.2.12 Methodologies for teaching empathy.....	105
4.2.13 Methodologies for teaching freedom	106
4.2.14 Methodologies for teaching fair go	107
4.2.15 Methodologies for teaching do your best.....	108
4.2.16 Methodologies for teaching responsibility.....	109
4.2.17 Methodologies for teaching democracy	110
4.2.18 Methodologies for teaching critical thinking	111
4.2.19 Methodologies for teaching integrity	112
4.2.20 Methodologies for teaching forgiveness	113
4.2.21 Methodologies for teaching sharing.....	114
4.2.22 Methodologies for teaching inclusiveness	115
4.2.23 Methodologies for teaching equality.....	116
4.3 Perspectives of teachers on values education delivery process in schools	117
4.3.1 Values and education for values	119

4.3.2 Teachers' para-professional role	120
4.3.3 Delivering values education.....	122
4.3.4 Low morale	124
4.3.5 Lack of customized training for values education	125
4.4 Descriptive data analysis.....	126
4.4.1 Exploratory factor analysis	130
4.4.2 Family	130
4.4.3 Analyzing the Results obtained under family	135
4.4.4 School	136
4.4.5 Analyzing the Results obtained under school	144
4.4.6 Media	145
4.4.7 Analyzing the Results obtained under media.....	148
4.4.8 Society and culture.....	149
4.4.9 Analyzing the Results obtained under society and culture	154
4.4.10 Religion.....	156
4.4.11 Analyzing the Results obtained under religion	160
4.4.12 Determination of relative impact of the values education factors on perceived effectiveness of values education (Regression Analysis)	163
4.4.13 Sampling adequacy test.....	163
4.4.14 Common Method Bias (Harman Single Factor test).....	164
4.4.15 Reliability analysis	164
4.4.16 Analysis of descriptive statistics	165
4.4.17 Determination of the relationship between values education factors and perceived effectiveness of values education	166
4.4.18 Collinearity Statistics of variables	170
4.4.19 Summary of regression analysis	171
4.5 Developing values education hierarchical model Framework using Total Interpretive Structural Modeling (TISM).....	175
4.5.1 Total Interpretive Structural Modeling (TISM):	175
4.5.2 Results, analysis, and development of TISM.....	176
4.5.3 TISM diagraph	192

4.5.4 Analysis of TISM model.....	194
Chapter 5: Findings, Conclusions, and Limitations	196
5.1 List of values to taught in schools.....	196
5.2 List of top fifteen methodologies for teaching values.....	197
5.3 Regression model.....	202
5.4 The TISM hierarchy model.....	203
5.5 Conclusion	203
5.6 The values education framework model	204
5.7 Suggestions and Recommendations	206
5.8 Research implication.....	208
5.9 Limitation.....	208
5.10 Scope for Future research	209
6. References.....	210
7. Annexure.....	222
7.1 Questionnaire on Framework for Education for Values in schools	222
7.2 Factors impacting values education for children	225
7.3 Questionnaire on framework for Value Education in schools	228
7.4 A report on ‘Education for Values in Schools – A Framework (NCERT, 2005)	234
8. Bio Data	239

List of figures

S.No	Figure Number	Topic	Page No
1	1.1	Value Education concerns in Indian key policy documents	4
2	2.1	Review of literature flowchart	32
3	2.2	Space occupied by research papers on values education in schools	33
4	2.3	Classification on the basis of research type	35
5	2.4	Distribution of articles by tool / Methodology used for analysis	36
6	2.5	Co-occurrences of author keywords (density visualization)	37
7	2.6	Total link strength and occurrence of author keywords	37
8	2.7	Bibliographic coupling of the sources (network visualization)	38
9	2.8	Bibliographic coupling of the countries (overlay visualization)	39
10	2.9	Bibliographic coupling of the authors (overlay visualization)	40
11	2.10	Bibliographic coupling of the publications (overlay visualization)	42
12	2.11	Bibliographic coupling of organizations (overlay visualization)	43
13	2.13	Co-citation image diagram of cited references	44
14	3.1	Research flow of methodologies mapped to each research objective	56
15	3.2	Steps in the process of development of TISM	83
16	4.1	Model of teachers' experiences in the process of values education	118
17	4.2	Values education in school (Source: Teachers' responses)	125
18	4.3	Scree plot	134
19	4.4	Scree plot	143

20	4.5	Scree plot	148
21	4.6	Scree plot	154
22	4.7	Scree plot	160
23	4.8	Frequency graph (histogram) of dependent variable	170
24	4.9	Result of regression analysis (regression model)	174
25	4.10	Diagraph with significant transitive links	188
26	4.11	Interpretive structural model (ISM) of values education framework	192
27	4.12	Total interpretive structural model (TISM) of values education in schools	193
28	5.1	Result of regression analysis (regression model), source: respondents	202
29	5.2	Values education framework model	205

List of Tables

S.No	Table Number	Topic	Page No
1	2.1	Descriptions of values from the literature	12
2	2.2	Piaget's model of the cognitive theory of moral development	15
3	2.3	Kohlberg theory of moral development (1969)	16
4	2.4	The 4-component model (Bebeau, Rest & Narvaez, 1999)	18
5	2.5	Descriptions of values education from literature	20
6	2.6	Factors related to values education from literature	26
7	2.7	Publication Records and Percentages by Publication Years	33
8	2.8	Significant authors and their publications	41
9	2.9	Most cited references in each cluster	45
10	3.1	Respondents' detail	61
11	3.2	List of values	62
12	3.3	Respondents' detail	63
13	3.4	List of methodologies to teach values in schools	64
14	3.5	Teachers' background information	66
15	3.6	Background information of respondents	68
16	3.7	Correlation values and their interpretation	74
17	4.1	Values at rank 1 (R1)	84
18	4.2	Values at rank 2 (R2)	85
19	4.3	Values at rank 3 (R3)	86
20	4.4	Values at rank 4 (R4)	86
21	4.5	Values at rank 5 (R5)	87

22	4.6	Most preferred 15 Values	88
23	4.7	Currently taught values at R1	88
24	4.8	Currently taught values at R2	89
25	4.9	Currently taught values at R3	89
26	4.10	Currently taught values at R4	90
27	4.11	Currently taught values at R5	90
28	4.12	Most preferred currently taught values (top fifteen)	91
29	4.13	Combined list	92
30	4.14	Final list of values category wise	93
31	4.15	Methodologies for teaching respect	95
32	4.16	Methodologies for teaching honesty	96
33	4.17	Methodologies for teaching trustworthiness	97
34	4.18	Methodologies for teaching peace	98
35	4.19	Methodologies for teaching justice	99
36	4.20	Methodologies for teaching understanding	100
37	4.21	Methodologies for teaching tolerance	101
38	4.22	Methodologies for teaching love	102

39	4.23	Methodologies for teaching care	103
40	4.24	Methodologies for teaching compassion	104
41	4.25	Methodologies for teaching empathy	105
42	4.26	Methodologies for teaching freedom	106
43	4.27	Methodologies for teaching fair go	107
44	4.28	Methodologies for teaching do your best	108
45	4.29	Methodologies for teaching responsibility	109
46	4.30	Methodologies for teaching democratic value	110
47	4.31	Methodologies for teaching critical thinking	111
48	4.32	Methodologies for teaching integrity	112
49	4.33	Methodologies for teaching forgiveness	113
50	4.34	Methodologies for teaching sharing	114
51	4.35	Methodologies for teaching inclusiveness	115
52	4.36	Methodologies for teaching equality	116
53	4.37	The initial factor groups/ dimensions and items associated with values education	126
54	4.38	Items related to family	130

55	4.39	KMO and Bartlett's Test	131
56	4.40	Reliability Statistics	131
57	4.41	Communalities	132
58	4.42	Total Variance Explained	132
59	4.43	Rotated Component Matrix	133
60	4.44	Final factor and items after exploratory factor analysis	135
61	4.45	Items related to schools	136
62	4.46	KMO and Bartlett's Test	137
63	4.47	Reliability Statistics	138
64	4.48	Communalities	138
65	4.49	Total Variance Explained	139
66	4.50	Rotated Component Matrix	143
67	4.51	Final factors and items after exploratory factor analysis	144
68	4.52	Items related to media	145
69	4.53	KMO and Bartlett's Test	146
70	4.54	Reliability Statistics	146
71	4.55	Communalities	146

72	4.56	Total Variance Explained	147
73	4.57	Component Matrix	147
74	4.58	Final factor and items after exploratory factor analysis	149
75	4.59	Items related to society and culture	149
76	4.60	KMO and Bartlett's Test	150
77	4.61	Reliability Statistics	151
78	4.62	Communalities	151
79	4.63	Total Variance Explained	152
80	4.64	Rotated Component Matrix	153
81	4.65	Final factor and items after exploratory factor analysis	155
82	4.66	Items related to religion	156
83	4.67	KMO and Bartlett's Test	157
84	4.68	Reliability Statistics	157
85	4.69	Communalities	157
86	4.70	Total Variance Explained	157
87	4.71	Component Matrix	158
88	4.72	Final factor and items after exploratory factor analysis	161

89	4.73	Final values education factors and items after exploratory factor analysis	161
90	4.74	KMO and Bartlett's Test	164
91	4.75	Reliability Statistics	165
92	4.76	Descriptive Statistics	165
93	4.77	Relationship between factors related to values education and perceived effectiveness of values education	166
94	4.78	Model Summary	168
95	4.79	ANOVA	169
96	4.80	Coefficient of Collinearity Statistics of variables	171
97	4.81	Regression analysis result	172
98	4.82	Factors (elements) affecting values education	176
99	4.83	Interpretive logic—knowledge base	177
100	4.84	Reachability matrix (RM)	183
101	4.85	Binary matrix (BM) after including the significant transitive relationship	184
102	4.86	Partitioning the Reachability matrix into different levels	185
103	4.87	List of factors and their levels in TISM	186
104	4.88	Interaction matrix	188

105	4.89	Interpretive matrix	189
106	4.90	Comparison of prioritization (of factors) based on regression analysis and TISM	194
107	5.1	List of values to taught (an outcome of the study)	197
108	5.2	List of top fifteen methodologies for teaching values	198

List of abbreviation

S. No.	Item	Description
1	NCERT	National Council of Educational Research and Training
2	NCF	National Curriculum Framework
3	NEP	National Education Policy
4	CBSE	Center Board of Secondary Schools
5	UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
6	NCFSE	National Curriculum Framework for School Education
7	NPE	National Policy for Education