

THE METAPHYSICS OF CONTINUITY OF CONSCIOUSNESS

AMIT ANURAG



DEPARTMENT OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

JULY 2022

© Indian Institute of Technology Delhi (IITD), New Delhi, 2022

THE METAPHYSICS OF CONTINUITY OF CONSCIOUSNESS

by

AMIT ANURAG

Department of Humanities and Social Sciences

Submitted

in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

to the



INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI

JULY 2022

CERTIFICATE

This is to certify that the thesis titled “**The Metaphysics of Continuity of Consciousness**”, submitted by **Amit Anurag**, to the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi for the award of **Doctor of Philosophy** is a record of bona fide research work carried out by him under our supervision. The contents of this thesis, in full or in parts, have not been submitted to any other institute or university for the award of any degree or diploma.

Prof. C.A. Tomy

Professor

Department of Philosophy

University of Hyderabad

Hyderabad

India

Prof. Purnima Singh

Professor

Department of Humanities and Social Sciences

Indian Institute of Technology Delhi

New Delhi

India

Date: 27 July 2022

Place: New Delhi

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My greatest debt is to my primary supervisor Professor C.A. Tomy. I have been greatly benefited from his philosophical insights and incisive comments. He thoroughly went through my writings and gave me exhaustive and in-depth comments. He was always available for a quick brainstorming session whenever I felt stuck with an idea. Discussing philosophy with him is always a pleasure. Special thanks to my co-supervisor, Professor Purnima Singh. She has been a great support to me and often has gone out of her way to help in every possible way. I am indebted to both my supervisors for their unflinching support through the thick and thin of my Ph.D. journey.

Thanks to the members of my research committee, Professor Bijoy Baruah, Professor Sanil, Professor Manidipa Sen, and Divya Dwivedi, for their engaging conversations and insightful comments, especially when the ideas for this thesis were still taking shape.

I am grateful to Arudra Burra, and Bharati Puri for the warmth they have always shown for me.

My cousins Anurag and Aniket read the entire draft in a very short time and identified the stylistic and typographical errors that I would have never been able to find.

Thanks to Rituparna, Satarupa, Ahalya, Garima, and Hemant, from whom I have always received assistance and friendly advice. It has always been great to be in their company.

My acknowledgment will be incomplete without remembering my friend Alan Stanley, a promising philosopher, who left us all too soon.

I would like to thank my colleagues at FLAME University, especially Sabah, Aparna, and Andrea.

This thesis could not have materialized without the unconditional love, unflinching trust, and untiring care of my mother who endured the ups and downs of my Ph.D. journey with me.

ABSTRACT

In this thesis, I address the problem of continuity of consciousness. I make a distinction between the phenomenal continuity and the metaphysical continuity of consciousness, and go on to address the question that how consciousness as a concrete entity continues in time.

The argument in my thesis proceeds as follows. First, I ask what is the broadest ontological category into which consciousness falls, and the answer is that of concrete entity. Then I look at how concrete entities continue in time or persist. I consider two theories of persistence- endurantism and perdurantism and I reject the latter. I also reject the idea of persistence dualism, that concrete things/objects endure whereas events perish. Thus, everything endures. Then I look at three more ontological categories often ascribed to mental entities- they are events, processes, and states. Upon analysis I find that events and states cannot be concrete, only processes can be so. Therefore, if consciousness is a concrete entity, it either has to be a thing or a process. I reject that consciousness is a thing and argue that it is a process. The thesis statement of this work is that consciousness is an enduring process.

Key words: metaphysics, consciousness, persistence, endurantism, process, events, states

सार

चेतना की निरंतरता की तत्त्वमीमांसा

प्रस्तुत शोध में मैं चेतना की निरंतरता की विवेचना करता हूँ। सर्वप्रथम मैंने चेतना की इन्द्रियग्राह्य (फेनोमेनल) निरंतरता और तत्त्वमीमांसिक (मेटाफिज़िकल) निरंतरता के बीच भेद किया है। तत्पश्चात् मैं यह प्रस्तावित करता हूँ की चेतना एक मूर्त तत्त्व है, फिर स्थापित करता हूँ की चेतना एक मूर्त तत्त्व के रूप में समय में किस प्रकार निरंतरता स्थापित करती है।

मेरे तर्क का क्रम कुछ इस प्रकार है: सर्वप्रथम मैं चेतना की सत्तामूलक श्रेणी निर्धारित करता हूँ, जोकि मेरे मतानुसार मूर्त श्रेणी है। तदोपरान्त यह निर्धारित करता हूँ की कोई भी मूर्त तत्त्व समय में किस प्रकार निरंतरता स्थापित करता है। इसके हेतु मैं समय में निरंतरता के दो सिद्धांतों की समीक्षा करता हूँ। यह सिद्धांत हैं ईडुरांटिस्म (पूर्ण उपस्थित) व पुरडुरांटिस्म (आंशिक उपस्थित)। मैं आंशिक उपस्थित के सिद्धांत का खंडन करता हूँ। मैं समय में निरंतरता की द्वैतवाद की अवधारणा का भी खंडन करता हूँ, जिसके अनुसार वस्तु पूर्ण उपस्थित होती है और घटना आंशिक उपस्थित होती है। अतः समस्त मूर्त तत्त्व केवल पूर्ण उपस्थित होते हैं।

तत्पश्चात् मैं तीन अन्य सत्तामूलक श्रेणियों का विश्लेषण करता हूँ- यह हैं घटना, प्रक्रिया, व अवस्था। विश्लेषण के उपरान्त मैं इस निष्कर्ष पर आता हूँ की घटना और अवस्था मूर्त नहीं हो सकती हैं, परन्तु प्रक्रिया मूर्त होती है। अतः यदि चेतना मूर्त है तो यह या तो एक वस्तु है या एक प्रक्रिया है। मैं चेतना के वस्तु होने का खंडन करता हूँ और इस निष्कर्ष पर आता हूँ की चेतना एक प्रक्रिया है। मेरे शोध का सार है की चेतना एक पूर्ण उपस्थित प्रक्रिया है।

Contents

Acknowledgments	i
Abstract	ii
Hindi Abstract	iii
Introduction	1
1. Consciousness is Concrete.....	6
2. Dissertation Structure.....	8
Chapter One: Time and Continuity	13
1.1. The A-Series and B-Series of Time.....	14
1.2. Presentism and Eternalism.....	16
1.3. Persistence and the Problem of Temporary Intrinsic.....	19
1.4. Perdurantism and the Doctrine of Temporal Parts.....	21
1.5. Change and Temporal Parts.....	22
1.6. Spatio-Temporal Analogy.....	24
1.7. How to Endure.....	34
1.8. Conclusion.....	35
Chapter Two: The Extensional and The Atomic Theories of Temporal Consciousness	37
2.1. Husserl and Broad.....	39
2.2. The Extensional Theories of Temporal Experience.....	43
2.3. The Atomic Theory of Temporal Experience.....	48
2.4. Conclusion.....	52
Chapter Three: Events, Processes, and States	54
3.1. Continuants and Occurrents.....	57
3.2. Davidson and Particularity of Events.....	58
3.3. The Semantics of Aspects.....	60
3.4. The Metaphysics of Events and Processes: Mourelatos and Crowther.....	67
3.5. Against Persistence Dualism.....	74
3.6. The Metaphysics of Events and Processes: Stout.....	77
3.7. The Metaphysics of States.....	84
3.8. Conclusion.....	95
Chapter Four: A Processive View of Consciousness	97
4.1. A Thing View of Consciousness.....	97
4.2. Experience in the Frozen Time.....	99
4.3. O’Shaughnessy’s Theory of Processive Consciousness.....	102
4.4. There Are No Dispositional Mental States.....	105
4.5. Phenomenology of Thought.....	109
4.6. Conclusion.....	115

Concluding Remarks.....117
Bibliography.....119