

**SELECT ASPECTS OF PERFORMANCE  
MANAGEMENT IN FEDERAL GOVERNMENT  
STRUCTURE IN INDIA: A DIAGNOSTIC ANALYSIS**

by

**DEVESH CHATURVEDI**

**Department Of Management Studies**

**Submitted**

**In fulfillment of the requirements of the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy**

to the



**INDIAN INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY DELHI  
MARCH 2013**

## **CERTIFICATE**

The thesis entitled “Select Aspects of Performance Management in Federal Government Structure in India: A Diagnostic Analysis” being submitted by Mr. Devesh Chaturvedi to the Indian Institute of Technology Delhi, for the award of degree of Doctor of Philosophy, is a record of bona fide research carried out by him. He has worked under my guidance and supervision and has fulfilled all the requirements for the submission of thesis, which has attained the standard required for a Ph.D. degree of the Institute. The results presented in the thesis have not been submitted elsewhere for the award of any degree or diploma.

Place: New Delhi

(Vinayshil Gautam)

Department of Management Studies  
Indian Institute of Technology Delhi  
New Delhi-110016  
India

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

---

With deep sense of gratitude and indebtedness, I would like to acknowledge the guidance and encouragement given by my supervisor, Professor Vinayshil Gautam for this research work. He has always been a source of inspiration and has been extremely generous in providing advice, guidance and inputs despite his busy schedule and multiple pre-occupations. Every interaction with him has been an opportunity to learn and bring in clarity of concepts.

I express my sincere thanks to Professor Harish Chowdhary, Professor S.S. Yadav, Professor P.K. Jain, Professor Kanika Bhal, Professor Seema Sharma, Professor Vighneshwara Ilawarsana and all other faculty for their support and encouragement. I am also thankful to the staff of the Department of Management Studies for their continuous cooperation and facilitation. I also thank all research scholars of the Department of Management Studies for their cooperation and help.

I am also indebted to the support and encouragement provided by Shri Sujit Banerjee and Shri R.H Khwaja, former Union Tourism Secretaries and Shri Sanjay Kothari former Additional Secretary (Tourism) without which this work would not be possible. My colleagues and friends Dr Manas Bhattacharya, Dr R.N Pandey and Shri A.K Gupta also contributed significantly by providing their inputs and sharing their knowledge on the issues related to the study.

I am thankful to other officers of Ministry of Tourism for valuable support and encouragement. I am especially thankful to all the senior civil servants working in various ministries of Government of India and the esteemed office bearers of stakeholder organizations who spared their valuable time for responding to the questionnaire and for interviews.

I express my heartiest thanks to my wife Shivani and children- Venkatesh and Gauri for their cooperation, encouragement and understanding which enabled me to devote sufficient time to the research work.

Last but not the least, this research study and preparation of this report has been contributed by several persons whose names have not been mentioned above. I express my thanks to all of them.

Devesh Chaturvedi

## ABSTRACT

Performance Management System (PMS) in context of Government can be considered as a set of instruments or tools used to achieve the overall objective of Good Governance. The present study is an attempt to analyse the select aspects of Performance Management (PMS) in Government including Performance Contracting, in a scholastic mode.

Executive perceptions of civil servants and external stakeholders were obtained through an elaborate structured questionnaire based survey. Qualitative perceptions of the civil servants were obtained through semi-structured interviews. A deeper analysis of PMS practices while undertaking activity in project mode was also undertaken.

The data obtained was analysed using multiple statistical techniques like the One-Way ANOVA, t-test, correlation, factor analysis for data reduction, discriminant analysis for comparing factors discriminating between distinctive groups of sample and regression analysis. The findings of quantitative analysis were corroborated and validated with qualitative analysis to test the research hypothesis and answer the research questions.

The analysis has been able to establish the significant relationships of effectiveness of PMS with aspects like Performance Appraisal, Performance Measurement, Incentive systems, Human Resource Development policies, organisation structures and processes. The results also indicate that the Performance Contracting process recently introduced in Central Government has a significant and positive impact on the performance of ministries. The influence of application of technological developments on performance of Government has been analysed. The factors that are critical determinants of effective implementation of E-Governance measures have been delineated.

The recommendations and findings of the study will hopefully provide policy advice and contribute towards evolving an integrated framework of Performance Management for Good Governance, in the emerging technological and socio-economic context in India

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

<b>S.NO .</b>	<b>DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>PAGE NO.</b>
I	Certificate	i
II	Acknowledgement s	ii-iii
III	Abstract	iv
IV	Table of Contents	v-ix
V	List of Figures	x-xi
VI	List of Tables	xii-xiv
VII	List of Abbreviations	xv-xviii
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION, BACKGROUND AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY</b>		<b>1-13</b>
1.1	Introduction and Background	2
1.2	Need for the Study	5
1.3	Objectives	6
1.4	Scope of Work	7
1.5	Brief Outline of Methodology	8
1.6	Chapterization of the Thesis	10
1.7	Concluding Remarks	13
		<b>14-66</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW</b>		
2.1	Defining Performance Management	15
2.2	Genesis of PMS in India	29
2.3	Performance Measurement System	32
2.4	Performance Appraisal	41
2.5	Performance Contracts	49
2.6	Performance Incentivisation	53
2.7	Accountability Mechanisms	55
2.8	Capacity Building for Performance	57
2.9	ICT and Performance Management	58
2.10	Summary of Literature and Identification of Research Gaps	63

**CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH FRAMEWORK,  
CONCEPTUALIZATION AND  
METHODOLOGY** **67-100**

3.1	Introduction	68
3.2	Research Methodology	68
3.3	Research Objectives	70
3.4	Scope of Work	71
3.5	Research Framework	72
3.6	Research Questions	75
3.7	Research Hypothesis for Study	77
3.8	Development of Questionnaire	80
3.9	Sampling Plan	92
3.10	Administering of Questionnaire	92
3.11	Qualitative Study: PMS in Project Mode	94
3.12	Collection of Secondary Data	96
3.13	Data Analysis	97
3.14	Ethics in Research	98
3.15	Concluding Remarks	99

**101-226**

**CHAPTER 4: DETERMINANTS OF PERFORMANCE  
MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS: EVOLVING AN  
INTEGRATED FRAMEWORK**

4.1	Introduction	104
4.2	Descriptive Statistics for the Sample	105
4.3	Quantitative analysis: Descriptive Statistics for the PMS	109
4.3.1	Organisation, Vision, Mission, Action plan and targets	110
4.3.2	Performance Measurement Systems	111
4.3.3	Performance Appraisal Systems	113
4.3.4	Performance Based Incentives	115
4.3.5	Capacity Building and HR Development	117
4.3.6	Accountability Mechanisms	119
4.3.7	Organisation Structures	121
4.3.8	Performance Evaluation and External Stakeholder Involvement	126
4.3.9	Reviewing and Monitoring Processes	127
4.3.10	Performance Management in Federal Structure	130
4.3.11	Perceptions of Civil Servants on Indicators of Performance	131
4.3.12	Relationships between factors of PMS and indicators of Performance	132

4.4	External Stakeholder Assessment of PMS in Government	146
4.4.1	Sample Plan	146
4.4.2	Organization, Vision, Mission and Annual Work Plans	147
4.4.3	Performance Measurement System	148
4.4.4	Accountability Mechanisms	149
4.4.5	Stakeholder Involvement in Policy Making	150
4.4.6	Review and Monitoring Processes of Government	151
4.4.7	Indicators of performance	152
4.5	Performance Management in project mode: case of Commonwealth Games-2010	155
4.5.1	Introduction	155
4.5.2	Overview	156
4.5.3	Governance Structure for the CWG	158
4.5.4	Indicators of Mal-Performance	161
4.5.5	Performance Parameters	165
4.5.6	Performance Measurement Systems	173
4.5.7	Organization Structures and Processes within the Organising Committee	175
4.5.8	Performance Appraisal and Accountability	176
4.5.9	Ownership of the Games	179
4.5.10	Performance Budgeting	181
4.5.11	CWG-2010 in Framework of Performance Management: Lessons Learnt	182
4.6	Testing of Hypotheses	184
4.7	Qualitative data analysis and its synthesis with quantitative data analysis	197
4.7.1	Vision, Mission and Objectives	197
4.7.2	Performance Appraisal	198
4.7.3	Performance Measurement Systems	204
4.7.4	Performance related Incentives	205
4.7.5	HR and Capacity Building	208
4.7.6	External Stakeholder Participation	210
4.7.7	Accountability and Performance Orientation	211
4.7.8	Decision Making Structures	217
4.7.9	Work Methods	220
4.7.10	Governance deficit and its impact on Performance	222
4.7.11	PMS as a control system	224
4.8	Concluding Remarks	225

**CHAPTER 5: PERFORMANCE EVALUATION THROUGH CONTRACTING : THE RESULTS FRAMEWORK DOCUMENT (RFD) AND ITS INTEGRATION WITH THE PMS 227-263**

5.1	Introduction	228
5.2	Results Framework Document and Performance in Government	230
5.2.1	Impact Analysis of Factors Influencing the Effectiveness of RFD	230
5.2.2	Perceptions about effectiveness of RFD	234
5.2.3	Relationship between determinants of effectiveness of RFD and indicators of effectiveness of RFD	237
5.2.4	Factor analysis and Regression analysis	240
5.3	External Stakeholder assessment of RFD process	244
5.4	Testing of hypothesis	245
5.5	Interpretation of results, conclusions and recommendations	248
5.5.1	Perceived Impact of RFD	248
5.5.2	Perceived Gaps in implementation of RFD process	254
5.6	Concluding Remarks	263

**CHAPTER 6: TECHNOLOGY AND PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT 264-289**

6.1	Introduction	265
6.2	Technological Context and Performance in Government	266
6.2.1	Usage of Internet	266
6.2.2	Web-enabled applications	268
6.2.3	Mobile Telephony	269
6.2.4	Detailed analysis of usage of I.C.T. in organizations processes	273
6.2.5	Data Reduction and Discriminant Analysis	279
6.3	External Stakeholder assessment of Technology and Performance Management in Government	282
6.4	Qualitative data analysis and its synthesis with quantitative data	283
6.5	Concluding Remarks	288

**CHAPTER 7: SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND IMPLICATIONS OF STUDY 290-308**

7.1	Summary of Recommendations	291
7.1.1	Select aspects of Performance Management	291

7.1.2	Technology and Performance Management	298
7.1.3	PMS and RFD Framework	300
7.2	Implications of the Research	303
7.3	Concluding Remarks	308

**CHAPTER 8: LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY AND FUTURE DIRECTION OF RESEARCH 309-313**

8.1	Limitations of the Study	310
8.2	Future direction of research	311
8.3	Concluding Remarks	313

REFERENCES 314-321

APPENDICES 322-351